



March 2017

***VALUE FOR MONEY ASSESSMENT FOR 0-25 RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT
PROJECT***

Final report prepared by

Centre for Local Economic Strategies

Presented to

NHS Salford CCG, Salford City Council and Salford CVS

CONTENTS	PAGE NO.
Executive Summary	4
1 INTRODUCTION	7
1.1 About the Salford 0-25 research and development project	7
1.2 About our approach and methodology	7
1.2.1 Development of VfM framework	7
1.2.2 Initial engagement with organisations	7
1.2.3 Case study work with organisations	7
1.2.4 Developing value for money assessments	8
1.2.5 Contextualising the findings and developing recommendations	8
2 DEVELOPMENT OF VFM FRAMEWORK	9
2.1 The initial development of the framework	9
2.2 The final VfM framework	10
2.3 Stratification for case studies	11
3 INITIAL FINDINGS OF ENGAGEMENT WITH ORGANISATIONS	12
3.1 Contextual information	12
3.1.1 An array of aims and objectives	12
3.1.2 Three core target groups	12
3.2 Inputs	12
3.2.1 A broad range of direct costs and sources of funding	12
3.3 Activities	12
3.3.1 A variety of activities	12
3.3.2 A strong history of VCSE activities in Salford	13
3.4 Outputs	13
3.4.1 A range of outputs	13
3.5 Outcomes	13
3.5.1 Diverse outcomes	13
3.6 Other VfM and wider considerations	13
3.6.1 A strategic fit	13
3.6.2 A recognition of attribution	13
4 CASE STUDY FINDINGS	15
4.1 Case study 1 – 53 rd Boys Brigade & Girls Association	15
4.1.1 Contextual information	15
4.1.2 Activities	15
4.1.3 Inputs and outputs	15
4.1.4 Outcomes	16
4.1.5 Other VfM and wider considerations	17
4.2 Case study 2 – Barton Athletic Club	18
4.2.1 Contextual information	18
4.2.2 Activities	18
4.2.3 Inputs and outputs	18
4.2.4 Outcomes	19
4.2.5 Other VfM and wider considerations	20
4.3 Case study 3 – BINOH & Compass	21
4.3.1 Contextual information	21
4.3.2 Activities	21
4.3.3 Inputs and outputs	22
4.3.4 Outcomes	22
4.3.5 Other VfM and wider considerations	23
4.4 Case study 4 – Community Social Inclusion Network	25
4.4.1 Contextual information	25
4.4.2 Activities	25

4.4.3	Inputs and outputs	25
4.4.4	Outcomes	26
4.4.5	Other VfM and wider considerations	26
4.5	Case study 5 – Manchester Giants Netball	28
4.5.1	Contextual information	28
4.5.2	Activities	28
4.5.3	Inputs and outputs	28
4.5.4	Outcomes	28
4.5.5	Other VfM and wider considerations	29
4.6	Case study 6 – Mums’ and Dads’ Club	31
4.6.1	Contextual information	31
4.6.2	Inputs and outputs	31
4.6.3	Outcomes	31
4.6.4	Other VfM and wider considerations	32
4.7	Case study 7 – Positive Moves	34
4.7.1	Contextual information	34
4.7.2	Activities	34
4.7.3	Inputs and outputs	34
4.7.4	Outcomes	35
4.7.5	Other VfM and wider considerations	35
4.8	Case study 8 – Salford Musical Youth	37
4.8.1	Contextual information	37
4.8.2	Activities	37
4.8.3	Inputs and outputs	37
4.8.4	Outcomes	38
4.8.5	Other VfM and wider considerations	38
4.9	Case study 9 – Salford Wheels for All	40
4.9.1	Contextual information	40
4.9.2	Activities	40
4.9.3	Inputs and outputs	41
4.9.4	Outcomes	41
4.9.5	Other VfM and wider considerations	42
4.10	Case study 10 – Warm Hut	44
4.10.1	Contextual information	44
4.10.2	Activities	44
4.10.3	Inputs and outputs	44
4.10.4	Outcomes	45
4.10.5	Other VfM and wider considerations	45
4.11	Overarching summary	47
4.11.1	Costs and values of 10 case study organisations	47
4.11.2	Increased confidence as a universal outcome	47
5	OTHER ORGANISATIONS	48
6	CONTEXTUALISING THE FINDINGS	52
6.1	Contextualisation	52
6.2	Recommendations	52
6.2.1	Recommendations for NHS Salford CCG and Salford City Council	52
6.2.2	Recommendations for Salford CVS	53
6.2.3	Recommendations for groups	53

FIGURES

No table of contents entries found.

TABLES

Table 1: 53 rd Boys Brigade & Girls Association	16
Table 2: Barton Athletic Club	18
Table 3: BINOH & Compass	22
Table 4: Community Social Inclusion Network	25
Table 5: Manchester Giants Netball	28
Table 6: Mums' and Dads' Club	31
Table 7: Positive Moves	35
Table 8: Salford Musical Youth	38
Table 9: Salford Wheels for All	41
Table 10: Warm Hut	44
Table 11: Overarching costs and values	47
Table 12: Consultees	ii

APPENDICES

1	Consultees	i
2	Guide for VfM framework	iii
3	Guide for case study consultation	vi

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

The Centre for Local Economic Strategies (CLES) is pleased to present this final report to NHS Salford CCG, Salford City Council, and Salford CVS. The report relates to work undertaken by CLES as part of the wider Salford 0-25 research and development project, which seeks to understand the scale and nature of organisations in Salford which provide activities for children and young people aged 0-25. The focus of CLES' work has been upon exploring the Value for Money (VfM) of activities provided by the Voluntary, Community and Social Enterprise (VCSE) sector for children and young people (aged 0-25) in Salford. It complements the work undertaken directly by Salford CVS around mapping and impact on a page. The Executive Summary largely follows the structure of the final report.

About our Approach and Methodology

The VfM element of the 0-25 research and development project has involved five activities:

- ❑ The first stage of the VfM element of the 0-25 research and development project has been to develop a bespoke VfM framework.
- ❑ Following approval of the VfM framework, CLES began the process of populating it with information from 17 VCSE organisations. We held telephone interviews with each organisation to gather further information around funding and outcomes, for example and to fill in any other gaps.
- ❑ Following the initial population of the VfM framework, CLES identified 10 organisations to undertake further case study work with. In particular, we hosted focus groups with children and young people; participated in some of each group's activities; and hosted interviews with project managers to gather further information for their VfM assessments. The focus during this deeper consultation has been upon gathering evidence to give a fair analysis of VfM against the four E's – Economy, Efficiency, Effectiveness and Equity.
- ❑ For each of the participating 17 VCSE sector organisations. We have undertaken two different levels of VfM assessments. For every organisation, we have used the framework to assess their Efficiency using a 'cost per output' calculation. The other 10 organisations worked with us to produce a more detailed case study. For these organisations, we produced further outcome based assessments of VfM which take into account a broader set of metrics related to the activities of the organisation and the other three of the four E's.
- ❑ Finally, we have put the findings of the VfM assessments in the context of wider policy and strategy in both Salford and Greater Manchester and developed specific recommendations.

Key qualitative findings of engagement with organisations

The work identified a number of key qualitative findings about the VCSE organisations undertaking activities with children and young people aged 0-25. These can be summarised as follows:

- ❑ Looking across the 17 VCSE organisations which have been involved in the VfM element of the research and development project, it is clear the organisations have a diverse set of aims and objectives. There are five common themes of aims and objectives which the organisations are seeking to achieve: to improve confidence and self-esteem; to improve (family) lives; to enhance the skills of individuals; to improve health and well-being; and to enhance opportunities for children and young people.
- ❑ Looking across the target groups it is evident that there are three different types of target group for their activities. First, there are children and young people as a collective in Salford. Second, there are groups of children and young people with specific needs such as: those with disabilities; young parents and carers; children of refugees and migrants; and children and young people from families with multiple and complex needs. Third, there are children and young people from different communities, geographical communities such as Langworthy; and religious communities such as the Jewish community.
- ❑ From looking across the direct costs associated with the 17 VCSE organisations, it is evident that the scale of the sector varies, as does the scope of activities for children and young people. The cost of

providing activities for children and young people varies from less than £10,000 per annum in some cases; and up to £700,000 in others. The vast majority of organisations however operate on resource of less than £50,000.

- ❑ The activities undertaken by the 17 VCSE organisations are shaped by their diverse aims and objectives. As such, the activities on offer are many and varied and include: weekend trips and summer camps; respite activities; youth clubs; and drop in sessions and advice and guidance activities.
- ❑ Of the 17 VCSE organisations we talked to, some have been active for over 100 years, while others only became established a year ago. Whilst the length of time they have been in operation is varied, every organisation is operating in response to an identified need in the community.
- ❑ The outputs each of the 17 organisations record include the numbers of people they are working with; the number of sessions provided; number of people attending the sessions/courses; and number of members.
- ❑ There are common types of outcomes across the 17 VCSE organisations including: building individual resilience through improved self-confidence/self-esteem; addressing social isolation to facilitate the growth of wider social and employability skills; raising aspirations and ambitions of young people – particularly for those in multigenerational workless household and those without family role models; improving physical health; and developing specific academic skills;

Key VfM findings of engagement with organisations

The work undertaken with the 10 case studies enabled us to determine the value added by the organisations (the net costs; the total value added (economy and effectiveness metrics); and the effective value generated) as detailed in the table below.

	Net Costs	Total value added	Effective value generated
53rd BB&GA	£6,558	£95,600	£89,042
Barton Athletic Club	£11,946	£79,220	£67,274
BINOH & Compass	£80,000	£247,600	£167,600
CSIN	£5,320	£261,954	£256,634
Manchester Giants Netball	£8,220	£40,118	£31,898
Mums' and Dads' Club	£583	£6,100	£5,517
Positive Moves	£48,200	£52,936	£4,736
Salford Musical Youth	£3,328	£2,988	£0
Salford Wheels for All	£24,624	£209,692	£185,068
Warm Hut	£6,885	£728,294	£721,409
Totals	£195,664	£1,724,502	£1,529,178

The findings from the ten case study organisations have been subsequently used to derive an overarching estimation of the value of VCSE organisations focused on children and young people when compared to their costs. This is done by dividing the total value added (£1,724,502) by the net costs (£195,664). **We therefore estimate that for every £1 spent by the ten organisations creates £8.81 of value.**

Recommendations

A number of specific recommendations were drawn from the VfM element of the work – these feed into the wider recommendations from the research and development project and include:

Recommendation 1 – NHS Salford CCG and Salford City Council to utilise the findings of this research to recognise and promote the value of the voluntary, community and social enterprise sector in providing activities for children and young people (aged 0-25): the work has identified that VCSE organisations provide a diversity of activities, contribute towards a range of outcomes, and bring savings for the state and impacts for the local economy and Salford residents. This value to be promoted and recognised when investing in future services.

Recommendation 2 – NHS Salford CCG and Salford City Council to support the development of VCSE provision for 0-25 year olds through the 0-25 transformation and to involve the VCSE in ongoing co-design of pathways and services.

Recommendation 3 – Salford CVS to continue signposting children and young people focused VCSE organisations to a full range of funding opportunities, particularly those with activities around health and well-being. The conversations undertaken as part of the VfM work suggested that many organisations were struggling to access appropriate funding and some appeared unaware of opportunities for grant funding at the local level. Salford CVS as managing agents for the Salford Third Sector Fund Grants Programme, which has annual funds available of £1million should continue to signpost this available funding and develop the awareness and skills in the sector.

Recommendation 4 – Related to recommendation 3, Salford CVS to continue providing capacity building support to children and young people focused voluntary, community and social enterprise organisations to support them to be grant and tender ready (where appropriate) and able to take up other relevant funding opportunities (e.g. community fundraising, sponsorship, subscriptions, social investment, corporate social responsibility funds etc.). By this we mean VCSEs have the capabilities to understand and capacity to complete documentation and other processes (e.g. marketing) to an adequate level and in a way that enables them to secure that funding.

Recommendation 5 – Salford CVS to continue providing specific support to organisations to enable them to demonstrate their impact and value for money. This should not be burdensome but should be relevant to the operating context and proportionate to the size and nature of the group. For example, a small number of outcomes and indicators which groups can relate to and tools which they can utilise to collect data and subsequently demonstrate the value of their activities.

Recommendation 6 – Each of the organisations engaged with as part of this work should know that their work is valued by partners, families and communities and should look to continue the provision of activities for their beneficiaries aged between 0 and 25. In addition they should be encouraged and supported to access development opportunities offered through the 0-25 transformation Programme including: training opportunities in emotional health and well-being, disability including autistic spectrum & speech language and communication awareness.

Recommendation 7 – Act on the recommendations provided by CLES to Salford CVS for each of the 10 case study organisations. These recommendations detail our thoughts on what each organisation could use some help with moving forward to boost the amount of value they are adding through their groups, we have also noted something each of them are already doing brilliantly. These recommendations are based on conversations with those running the groups, our experience in gathering the required information and our observations at our visits.

1 INTRODUCTION

The Centre for Local Economic Strategies (CLES) is pleased to present this final report to NHS Salford CCG, Salford City Council and Salford CVS. The report relates to work undertaken by CLES as part of the Salford 0-25 research and development project. The focus of CLES' work has been upon exploring the Value for Money (VfM) of activities provided by the Voluntary, Community and Social Enterprise (VCSE) sector for children and young people (aged 0-25) in Salford. The introduction provides some context to the Salford 0-25 research and development project alongside our approach and methodology for the VfM element.

1.1 About the Salford 0-25 research and development project

The Salford 0-25 research and development project seeks to understand the scale and nature of organisations in Salford which provide activities for children and young people aged 0-25. Driven by the Salford 0-25 Transformation Plan and supported by Salford City Council and NHS Salford CCG, the core focus of the project is upon understanding and mapping the activities provided by the VCSE sector and their impact. The project is being delivered by Salford CVS, with three key strands of activity:

- ❑ Strand 1 seeks to map 50 VCSE organisations across Salford and gather basic information about the types of activities they undertake, their target groups, their funding and their outputs and outcomes;
- ❑ Strand 2 relates to developing an 'Impact on a page report' for each of the 50 VCSE organisations. These reports have a specific emphasis on outputs, outcomes, impacts, aspirations and anecdotes;
- ❑ Strand 3 (the element undertaken by CLES and which this document reports upon) looks to understand the VfM of 17 of the VCSE organisations. In this we explore the economy, efficiency, effectiveness, and equity of ten organisations and carry out a lighter touch assessment with the other seven.

1.2 About our approach and methodology

CLES began work on the third strand of work in October 2016. The sections below outline the approach and methodology used.

1.2.1 Development of VfM framework

The first stage of the VfM element of the 0-25 research and development project has been to develop a bespoke VfM framework. CLES have used their experience of developing such frameworks elsewhere and consulted with members of the steering group throughout the drafting stages. The framework is designed to inform all the activities of the VfM element of the work, in particular it helps to collate the information used during the VfM assessments for each of the 17 VCSE organisations. Further information about the development of the framework can be found in section two.

1.2.2 Initial engagement with organisations

Following approval of the VfM framework, CLES began the process of populating it with information from the 17 VCSE organisations. Firstly, we engaged with the Development Officer from Salford CVS for the 0-25 research and development project to slot in existing information gathered from the other two strands of activities described above. Secondly, we held telephone interviews with each organisation to gather further information around funding and outcomes, for example and to fill in any other gaps. The themes that emerged from this early engagement are explored in section 3. The lines of inquiry used can be found in Appendix 2.

1.2.3 Case study work with organisations

Following the initial population of the VfM framework, CLES developed a means of stratifying the 17 organisations to identify 10 organisations to undertake further case study work with, details of the criteria used can be found in section 2. CLES worked with each of the 10 selected organisations to host focus groups with children and young people; participate in some of their activities; and host

interviews with project managers to gather further information for their VfM assessments. It is important to note that a VfM study goes further than a social value impact assessment in that a social value assessment will largely just focus on the effectiveness element. The focus during this deeper consultation has been upon gathering evidence to give a fair analysis of VfM against the four E's – Economy, Efficiency, Effectiveness and Equity. Each of the case studies can be found in section four. Appendix three details a few examples of the lines of enquiry used during the case study consultations.

1.2.4 Developing value for money assessments

The core purpose of the population of the framework has been to develop VfM assessments for each of the 17 VCSE sector organisations. We have undertaken two different levels of VfM assessments. For every organisation we have used the framework to assess their Efficiency using a 'cost per output' calculation. Seven of these assessments can be found in section five. The other 10 organisations worked with us to produce a more detailed case study. For these organisations we produced further outcome based assessments of VfM which take into account a broader set of metrics related to the activities of the organisation and the other three of the four E's. These deeper case studies can be found in section four. The lighter touch assessments can be found in section five.

1.2.5 Contextualising the findings and developing recommendations

Section 6 of the report puts the findings of the VfM assessments in the context of wider policy and strategy in both Salford and Greater Manchester. It also provides some specific recommendations relating to this element of the 0-25 research and development project. These will feed into discussions around recommendations from the project as a whole.

2 DEVELOPMENT OF VFM FRAMEWORK

This section presents the framework which underpins the work undertaken around exploring the Vfm of activities undertaken by VCSE organisations in Salford for children and young people (aged 0-25). The framework has been developed through: reviewing information and documentation associated with the 0-25 research and development project; drawing upon CLES' previous experience and knowledge of developing such frameworks; and engagement with members of the steering group for the 0-25 research and development project. We also detail the criteria used to identify and select organisations for the case study aspect of the work.

2.1 The initial development of the framework

A Vfm framework should provide a structured approach to assessing the extent to which an intervention or organisation provides value for money. By this we broadly mean the **outputs or outcomes** that intervention brings (for individuals, for local economies, for organisations, for the state) related to the **inputs** that went into that organisation or intervention (resource in the form of funding and staff/volunteer time). This Vfm assessment will explore the four E's:

- Economy – evidencing that the activities of the organisations have minimised public sector costs and were economical;
- Efficiency – evidencing that the services provided to achieve the outcomes were at a reasonable cost;
- Effectiveness – evidencing the extent to which the services have had the desired impact in terms of outcomes;
- Equity – evidencing the extent to which services reach out and are available to all people that they are intended to help.

An effective Vfm framework will therefore be the means through which evidence related to the four E's can be collected. The framework will gather information on:

- The context of the group;
- Inputs;
- Activities associated with the organisation or intervention;
- Outputs;
- Outcomes;
- Other Vfm and wider considerations including attribution.

At the outset of this work, CLES developed a draft Vfm framework for VCSE activities for children and young people (aged 0-25) in Salford. Themes from the feedback from Members of the steering group on the draft framework are detailed below.

The scale of the organisations involved

The work needs to be considerate of the various sizes of the VCSE organisations involved. Some of the organisations are very small and led by volunteers and therefore may not have access to some of the information and data required. Related to this, the consultation highlighted that some organisations were funded solely by the personal money of the individuals running them as opposed to accessing more formal funding; and that this needed to be reflected in the framework.

The need to gather softer outcomes

Whilst the core emphasis of the work being undertaken by CLES was upon value for money, there was a desire for the framework to also consider softer outcomes, which for many VCSE organisations are perhaps the most important thing to capture. The outcomes, whilst frequently difficult to quantify, may be very powerful and help change the lives of some of these young people. The consultation suggested that the framework needed to find a way of clearly articulating what would happen if the sector's activities did not exist.

The challenges associated with reliable input and data

Related to the point around the size of the organisations involved, the consultation also suggested that the framework and indeed the wider work needed to be reflective of the ability of the organisations to gather cost and output data, and to ensure that outputs and outcomes were not over-inflated.

The need to evidence perceived added value

There was a strong agreement and perception that VCSE organisations across Salford were already providing significant added value and that this work presented an opportunity to evidence that. For, example it is perceived that VCSE organisations provide young people with a broader support network both staff at the group and peers providing more positive influences. There is consensus that nearly all the activities are filling a gap, and therefore there is limited concern over any duplication with each other, or with the public sector. The challenge is evidencing this perception.

A need for it to be framed by the wider strategic context

The VfM framework and the work must be contextualised within, but not driven by, wider policy agendas. It was particularly felt that the activities of the organisations needed to be explored in the context of the Salford 0-25 Transformation Plan at the local level and in the new devolved context. In relation to the VCSE sector, it was felt that the work should also be relevant to the State of the Sector report currently being undertaken by Salford CVS.

The need to evidence the importance of volunteers

The VfM framework ought to evidence the importance of volunteers. This links to a number of previous points and identifies that many of the activities being undertaken around the 0-25 agenda in Salford are volunteer led and that the need for volunteers will only increase as austerity measures in the public sector continue.

2.2 The final VfM framework

CLES used the feedback above to develop the final version of the VfM framework. This version of the framework effectively shaped the activities of each aspect of the work and particularly the shape of the consultation with the individual VCSE sector organisations. The final version of the framework consists of the following themes and lines of inquiry:

- 1) Contextual information:
 - Organisation name;
 - Aims and objectives of the organisation/programme/project;
 - Criteria for judging performance (e.g. expected outputs/outcomes required by funders);
 - Target group for the organisation/programme/project;
- 2) Inputs:
 - Direct costs;
 - Indirect costs;
 - Sources of funding/income;
- 3) Activities:
 - Activities the organisation has been undertaking;
 - Length of time the activities have been undertaken for;
- 4) Outputs:
 - Outputs measured;
 - Data on outputs achieved;
- 5) Outcomes:
 - Outcomes achieved;
 - Data and evidence of outcomes achieved;
 - Evidence of sustainability of outcomes;
- 6) Other VfM and wider considerations:
 - Strategic fit/added value
 - Evidence of attribution (extent to which outcomes are achieved due to the organisation/programme)
 - Deadweight (the outcomes that would be achieved for beneficiaries if the organisation did not exist;
 - Equitability (the extent to which the organisation/programme is reaching all possible groups and places.

2.3 Stratification for case studies

Each of the 17 VCSE organisations involved will have their VfM assessed using elements of or all of the framework set out above. As detailed in the methodology and section 3, we have explored existing information and undertaken a telephone interview in order to populate the framework and to provide an Efficiency (cost per output) VfM calculation. However, for ten organisations and as detailed in section 4, we wanted to get a much deeper understanding of VfM through engaging with beneficiaries to explore outcomes and other VfM considerations such as Economy, Effectiveness and Equity. The key criteria for selecting the ten organisations were:

- ❑ Essentials
 - Keen to take part;
 - Availability of electronic data;
 - Availability (at a minimum) of cost per annum, how many projects they run, how often they run them and for how many people.

- ❑ Desirables
 - A representative split across each of the 3 'test cases' – Emotional Health and Wellbeing, Children with Disabilities, Therapies;
 - Diversity of target group;
 - Location in Salford (good spread across the geography).

3 INITIAL FINDINGS OF ENGAGEMENT WITH ORGANISATIONS

This section of the draft report presents the findings of the initial data gathering undertaken with the 17 involved VCSE organisations. It seeks to pick out common themes across the 17 organisations relating to each of the elements of the Vfm framework.

3.1 Contextual information

3.1.1 An array of aims and objectives

Looking across the 17 VCSE organisations which have been involved in the Vfm element of the research and development project, it is clear the organisations have a diverse set of aims and objectives. Some are focused purely on addressing issues associated with children and young people, with others having a much broader set of aims relating to the wider community or Salford as a place. There are five common themes of aims and objectives which the organisations are seeking to achieve:

- To improve confidence and self-esteem;
- To improve (family) lives;
- To enhance the skills of individuals;
- To improve health and well-being;
- To enhance opportunities for children and young people.

3.1.2 Three core target groups

Looking across the target groups it is evident that there are three different types of target group for their activities. First, there are children and young people as a collective in Salford. Second, there are groups of children and young people with specific needs such as: those with disabilities; young parents and carers; children of refugees and migrants; and children and young people from families with multiple and complex needs. Third, there are children and young people from different communities, geographical communities such as Langworthy; and religious communities such as the Jewish community.

3.2 Inputs

3.2.1 A broad range of direct costs and sources of funding

From looking across the direct costs associated with the 17 VCSE organisations, it is evident that the scale of the sector varies, as does the scope of activities for children and young people. The cost of providing activities for children and young people varies from less than £10,000 per annum in some cases; and up to £700,000 in others. The vast majority of organisations however operate on resource of less than £50,000.

This diversity of cost is also reflected in the sources of funding. Those organisations with smaller cost levels tend to rely on donations, fundraising and membership income to fund their activities; while those with larger cost levels are able to draw funding from Salford City Council and NHS Salford CCG and other sources of grant income such as the Big Lottery Fund and Comic Relief.

3.3 Activities

3.3.1 A variety of activities

The activities undertaken by the 17 VCSE organisations are shaped by their diverse aims and objectives. As such, the activities on offer are many and varied:

- Weekend trips and summer camps;
- Respite activities;
- Youth clubs;
- Drop in sessions and advice and guidance activities;
- Physical activity focused clubs;
- Food and growing activities;
- After school clubs;
- Music activity focused clubs;
- Specific activities for children and young people with disabilities and their families.

3.3.2 A strong history of VCSE activities in Salford

Of the 17 VCSE organisations we talked to, some have been active for over 100 years, while others only became established a year ago. Whilst the length of time they have been in operation is varied, every organisation is operating in response to an identified need in the community. It is evident that there is a wealth of committed VCSE organisations, young and old, providing activities for children and young people aged 0-25 in Salford.

3.4 Outputs

3.4.1 A range of outputs

The outputs of each of the 17 organisations will be clarified in more depth in the VfM assessments and case studies. However, it is important to note that there is data available for nearly all the organisations on the outputs that they have achieved over the course of the last year. This data can include numbers of people they are working with; the number of sessions provided; number of people attending the sessions/courses; and number of members. The provision of this data has helped us to build a good understanding of the types of outputs these organisations are achieving.

3.5 Outcomes

3.5.1 Diverse outcomes

Understanding the outcomes achieved by organisations is the most important element of any impact or VfM piece of work. These outcomes will be explored in more depth in the case studies in section 4, but it is important at this stage to reflect on common types of outcomes across the 17 VCSE organisations:

- Building individual resilience through improved self-confidence/self-esteem;
- Addressing social isolation to facilitate the growth of wider social and employability skills;
- Raising aspirations and ambitions of young people – particularly for those in multigenerational workless household and those without family role models;
- Strengthening the family unit by building connections between children and their parents (frequently resulting in changing parental attitudes towards their children's education);
- Improving physical health;
- Developing specific academic skills;
- Sign-posting to other services young people and their families may not have been aware of
- Helping to build a wider network of volunteers across Salford.

3.6 Other VfM and wider considerations

3.6.1 A strategic fit

It is apparent that many of the 17 VCSE sector organisations are providing activities with a strong strategic fit across different policy streams. Many organisations are working in deprived communities ensuring inclusion, developing skills and ultimately enhancing wellbeing where mainstream services have failed to connect with young people. As the funding for mainstream organisations continues to shrink the disconnect between them and young people does not look set to improve. The work carried out by the VCSE organisations across social, economic and health based policy spheres is ensuring that young people have a chance to achieve good outcomes. These VCSE organisations are actively helping public agencies achieve their objectives by filling key gaps in provision.

3.6.2 A recognition of attribution

Attribution is important when seeking to understand the impact of an organisation's activities. There may be other factors which contribute to outcomes, such as influence of friends and family or accessing other activities and services. Across the 17 VCSE sector organisations, it is apparent that many of the organisations do appreciate that there will be influences from elsewhere and that the outcomes achieved by young people cannot be solely attributed to them.

However, several are also confident that their organisation - due to factors such as location and speciality of services provided - will have a high level of attribution due to the significant gap in support they are filling. Indeed, when asked what would happen if their organisation did not exist, many felt

there would be a significant detrimental impact on personal outcomes and on the local community more widely for those which serve a unique area or group of people.

4 CASE STUDY FINDINGS

This section of the report presents the findings of the case studies with 10 selected VCSE organisations undertaking activities in Salford for children and young people (aged 0-25). Findings are detailed in relation to each aspect of the VfM framework followed by a VfM assessment which considers the attribution due to the organisation and the four E's - Economy, Efficiency, Effectiveness and Equity of the activities and outcomes delivered.

4.1 Case study 1 – 53rd Boys Brigade & Girls Association

4.1.1 Contextual information

The 53rd Boys Brigade and Girls Association (53rd BB&GA) is based in Langworthy and is part of the wider Manchester Battalion, the second largest Battalion in the country and one of the largest and longest established (since 1883) Christian youth organisations in the UK. They are committed to seeing lives enriched by supporting children and young people to reach their full potential.

The 53rd BB&GA provides opportunities for young people to meet and engage in a range of fun and developmental activities and experiences. The group facilitates a balanced programme of activities for youngsters between the ages of 5 and 18 from figure marching to craft, outdoor pursuits, and sports. Activities are designed in a creative way to make a positive contribution to each young person's experience.

The 53rd BB&GA has strong roots in the local community. Most often, members of the 53rd BB&GA had discovered the organisation through family and friends, many had siblings that had once been members and progressed into leadership roles. Some had parents that had been part of the same brigade in their youth.

4.1.2 Activities

The 53rd BB&GA meets weekly on a Monday evening between 6pm and 9pm and is split into 4 sections based on age; the Anchors section (aged 5-8), the Juniors section (aged 8-11), the Company section (age 11-15) and the Seniors section (aged 15-18). Each section has a special uniform that sets them apart from the other sections and plays a role in making them feel part of a troop, where all are equal.

Activities are tailored to each age group with younger and older sections joining together for certain activities. The 53rd BB&GA regularly take part in competitions using Monday evenings to prepare and practice. In addition to the regular weekly sessions the 53rd BB&GA also take weekend trips and go on summer camps to get the company involved in outdoor pursuits.

The holistic curriculum is delivered through a combination of fun activities, meditation, prayer, and the teaching of coping mechanisms. Weekly activities for all ages range from figure marching and drill practice to craft activities, cooking, sports (with unihoc, football, volleyball and table tennis among the favourites), chess and bible readings. The short bible readings explore morals and values that encourage young people to reflect on their actions and become more thoughtful in their approach.

Leaders ensure activities for the younger age groups are always fun, whilst being focussed on setting the foundation for promoting the leaders of tomorrow; citizenship training, character development and personal fitness. Other activities promote an active, social and creative lifestyle incorporating activities such as handicrafts, music, playing games, sports, going on visits and making friends. Successful completion of most of these activities earns a badge of merit, which acts as a motivator for young people to get involved and work towards their next badge. The older sections build on their earlier experiences in the company by incorporating further physical and spiritual development to strengthen their sense of character and give them the tools to push themselves forward in life.

4.1.3 Inputs and outputs

The costs per year are £10,443 with weekend trips and camp accounting for approximately 20% of the cost. Most of these costs are covered by donations and fund raising activities. Approximately 20% of the total money raised comes from weekly subs, with a much smaller amount raised through the tuck shop. On average 67 people attend per week through term time and they have 100 new faces at their weekly sessions each year suggesting a relatively low level of turnover.

Table 1: 53rd Boys Brigade & Girls Association

Session	Number of attendees per session*	Number of unique 0-25's engaged per year*	Number of sessions per year	Cost to run one session	Charge per attendee per session
Monday evenings	67	100	39 (term time)	£216	£1.50
Weekend trips	15		2	£900	£60
Summer camp	15		1	£900	£60

4.1.4 Outcomes

Key outcomes for young people at the 53rd BB&GA are broadened horizons, improved confidence and resilience and improved leadership skills. The leaders report witnessing improvements in behaviour among the most challenging of members and many parents report a positive impact at school.

Broadened horizons

The range of activities on offer provide opportunities for young people to develop and improve their social skills. There was consensus from the troop, that had they not been at the 53rd BB&GA on a Monday evening, they would be bored at home, watching TV, playing on an Xbox/phone/iPad. For many, the opportunity to do productive things, socialise and have fun with friends in a safe space was highly valued. The group agrees that they've been kept fit and healthy and adopted a healthier lifestyle as a result of a strong focus on sports and that volunteering in the wider community has helped them to understand some of the challenges faced by others living around them.

A number of the older group are working towards the Queen's Badge, the highest award available to a BB&GA member. Working towards the Queen's Badge provides individuals with new opportunities to expand their horizons, requiring them to participate in skills-based training, take responsibility within the 53rd BB&GA or Church, provide a voluntary service or support to others outside the 53rd BB&GA or Church, evidence the development of an interest (skills, physical, expedition) and participate in a residential activity.

Increased confidence and skills

Young people consistently referred to improved confidence, better listening skills and an enhanced respect for others as a result of being a member of the 53rd BB&GA. These skills are on display when they practice for drill and figure marching, where working as a team, keen listening skills and discipline are essential components of being able to confidently perform.

'My daughter is far more confident now, she used to be really shy, so much so that the teachers had spoken to us about it. This has really brought her out of her shell. It gives her an opportunity to get out of the house, there is not much for them to do in the winter with the dark nights. She is interacting with more people now and her confidence has shot up, not long ago she was doing a bible reading in the public speaking competition, it's quite a difference.'

Developed leadership skills

For those young people that progress through to the senior groups, their leadership skills come into their own with wider benefits at school, at college and in their home lives. A number of these young people move in to volunteering roles in the organisation and begin to facilitate the activities for younger members of the troop. This responsibility has kept older members of the 53rd BB&GA coming back and engaging with the group where they may have lost interest in other activities. Many other senior members stay engaged with the Boys Brigade informally through a Seniors Facebook page and attend and help out at some weekend activities.

'I would say that being in [53rd BB&GA] helps me with my college work, I'm doing sports coaching so when I come here I can use some of what I learn at college and put it into practice. I want to do my FA Level 2 coaching badges and hope to get a 2-year apprenticeship in a primary school.'

'After gaining the Queens Badge (the highest level) I went on to do the King George VI Youth Leadership Training, a residential course, where I had to lead a worship session, I was really nervous, but got through it and made some good friends along the way'

4.1.5 Other VfM and wider considerations

Attribution

The 53rd BB&GA provides a similar experience to other structured youth activities such as the Scouts and Girl Guides which also operate in the local area, but there doesn't appear to be any crossover. There is also a local youth club which provides a safe space for young people to socialise, some of the younger members attend this group and tend to be engaged in a wider range of activities outside the 53rd BB&GA than the older members of the troop. Considering the regularity of sessions for the 53rd BB&GA and member's clear affinity for the group, we estimate a fair attribution to be 80% to allow for the positive impact of other activities and the support of friends and family.

Economy

While the young people who attend the 53rd BB&GA may be at risk of low confidence and poor leadership skills in its absence. It is not assumed that in the groups absence that the young people in attendance would incur a cost to the public purse. For the 53rd BB&GA the real value is in their Effectiveness, equipping young people with softer skills to help them move through their own lives successfully and with a desire to help and support those around them.

Efficiency

The 53rd BB&GA spends £65.58 per young person per year to maintain each of the groups listed in Table 1.

Gross cost = £10,433

Less money charged to groups (including tuck shop and fund raising) = £3,875

Net cost = £6,558

Number of unique attendees = 100

Cost per unique attendee per year = £65.58

Effectiveness

Improved confidence was an outcome common across all age groups within the troop. The confidence that the young people gain is of equivalent efficacy and value to a young person's Self-Confidence and Assertiveness training course (valued at £1,195 per person)¹. The estimated value of the work done at the 53rd BB&GA to increase the confidence of its members is therefore £119,500. When accounting for 80% attribution this figure comes to £95,600.

Equity

The 53rd BB&GA is well rooted in the local area and is currently at capacity with very low levels of turnover. While the organisation does not turn people away if they want to join, they are not conducting active outreach to recruit new members. The current membership base is formed mostly of people that discovered the troop via family networks and word of mouth, it is broadly reflective of the demographics of the population in the area.

VfM summary – 53rd Boys Brigade & Girls Association

Net costs = £6,558

Total value added* = £95,600

Effective value generated = £89,042

*Economy and Effectiveness indicators

¹ <http://www.globalvaluexchange.org/outcomes/8279e41d9e5e0bd8499f0757>

4.2 Case study 2 – Barton Athletic Club

4.2.1 Contextual information

Barton Athletic was founded by Max Shacklady ABA Boxing Champion and Olympian in 1953. The club has over 200 members and is located in a brand new multi sports facility on Franklin Street, Salford. The gym provides members with the opportunity to participate in Boxing, Wrestling, Weightlifting, and Road Running classes, as well as facilitating multi-sport and general fitness sessions. The club is run exclusively by around 30 volunteers who support Barton Athletic through a mixture of back office, instructor, and coaching support. Over the last 12 years, more than 62,000 hours of unpaid volunteer time has enabled the Club to invest in improving its current site.

Barton Athletic aims to improve health & wellbeing locally, and acts as a community hub for the local area. The club also aims to enhance the social networks of local people and ensure that all young people have an equal chance to succeed in life. Barton Athletic pride themselves on providing a welcoming and intergenerational gym environment designed to broaden the social networks of both young and older members. The club treats all people as equals as they walk through the door and maintains a focus on individual improvement. Whilst the club caters for all ages, genders and abilities, 50% of members are young people aged between 8 and 25.

Barton Athletic relies on word-of-mouth to let people know what they do and how to access their services, to date this has seen their membership grow to more than 200 young people.

4.2.2 Activities

The club runs daily Boxing and Weightlifting sessions and holds a regular running club. In addition to this Barton Athletic provides general fitness sessions and a women's only session. The club is working together with the Boys and Girls Clubs of Greater Manchester, and organises activities not typically available to local residents such as canoeing or visits to other centres of sporting excellence such as the Velodrome and the Chill Factor^e etc.

4.2.3 Inputs and outputs

Barton Athletic costs £13,846 to run each year. The group is funded through a mixture of grant funding from Salford CCG and other funders, private donations and membership fees which range from £10 for an adult and £5 for juniors per year, with £2.50 for an adult per session and £1.50 for juniors. The centre has found it is increasingly filling the void created by recent cuts to local leisure and youth services with over 230 unique people engaged at the club each year.

Table 2: Barton Athletic Club

Session	Number of attendees per session*	Number of unique 0-25's engaged per year*	Number of sessions per year	Cost to run one session	Charge per attendee per session
General training 4 – 8.30pm	5	60	400	£14.60	Adult - £2.50 Junior - £1.50
Boxing 6.45 - 8.30pm	20	120	200	£14.60	Adult - £2.50 Junior - £1.50
Weightlifting 7 - 8pm	6	18	100	£14.60	Adult - £2.50 Junior - £1.50
Road running Tues 8 - 10pm	4	12	100	£14.60	Adult - £2.50 Junior - £1.50
Wrestling Weds 6 - 7pm	5	23	150	£14.60	Adult - £2.50 Junior - £1.50

4.2.4 Outcomes

A large number of young people have been coming to the club for between 2 to 4 years, over that time they reported improved physical health/lifestyle choices, increased confidence, and improved personal responsibility, as a result of accessing the training and facilities at Barton Athletic. The location of the club and the low prices were highlighted as being very important in enabling them to attend.

As a membership based locally owned club, Barton Athletic has a strong sense of collective identity. All of the young people interviewed reported that they really enjoyed their time at the centre and felt a strong connection to the club. The club's younger members are encouraged to step up and take more responsibility by helping to organise events and to sign up for courses such as first aid.

Increased confidence

All of the young people interviewed reported that they felt more confident in themselves as they were able to learn new skills, and could see their progress physically. The support provided by the Coaches and Club Members encouraged the young people to learn new techniques, alongside this the discipline required for different sports gave individuals a greater sense of mental and physical control leading to improved levels of confidence.

'It gives you confidence really because you learn new techniques, and you can see the progress. The discipline of it and the control gives you more as well.'

The young people value the supportive nature and expertise of the coaches who speak to them one on one, and explain how they can improve. The culture at the club created by the staff and attendees has helped to create a close knit community that encourages young people to progress and develop their skills.

'I tried a boxing academy but I came back as I didn't really feel comfortable, I felt training here was better cause people know you and they give you better feedback and care about you.'

Improvement in health

All of the young people interviewed reported improvements in their physical and mental health including things like more energy, an improved mood and better sleep. The young people at Barton Athletic felt a sense of pride in their physical achievements and improved levels of fitness. Their dedication to their sport at the gym has inspired a greater interest amongst the members in what they eat, as a result their diet has improved.

'You feel really good after your workout, you get an adrenaline high. It can be addictive you feel guilty if you don't come.'

'It changes your lifestyle as well because as you do it you become more aware of what you need to progress, so you change what you eat and eat healthier. There's discipline in that as well.'

'I've lost loads of weight because I've come to the gym'

Improved focus

A number of the young members reported improved outcomes ranging from improved concentration at school, to an improved personal outlook and attitude as a result of the discipline required to progress in their sport. They felt that with the support of the Coaches they were motivated to succeed in their chosen sport and to use the skills developed both inside and outside school. This is particularly important for many young members at Barton Athletic as many of the young people come from complex family backgrounds. Many young people only have the support of the gym to push them to succeed.

'The weightlifting has got me really into physiology and from a personal point of view I want to learn more.'

'Boxing is a lot of mental attitude, it's like you need to focus and concentrate and get in the zone'

4.2.5 Other VfM and wider considerations

Attribution

Barton Athletic is unique in Patricroft/Eccles as no other facility provides the environment, training, and support for young people to pursue specialist sports and general fitness at such an affordable rate. The nearest alternative is a council leisure centre that is not in walking distance from Barton Athletic. As few families have a car this is not an option for the members of Barton Athletic.

The young people interviewed felt that the club was almost entirely responsible for the positive impacts they experienced, as for many Barton Athletic was the only sports club/service they accessed. However, as we were unable to ascertain the wider services accessed by the young people we assume an 80% attribution rate to account for such impacts.

Economy

Looking specifically at the young people group at Barton Athletic the total cost saving to the public purse can be aligned to the number of children that may have required access to a GP. For example, if the ethos and access to the club had not encouraged them to keep active and adopt healthier lifestyles, it can be assumed that young people would be more likely to experience ill health or become over weight.

Assuming all 233 attendees currently attending the various groups at Barton Athletic would require access to a GP we can estimate a cost saving of £29,125 per year (based on the cost of £125 per child for access to General Medical Services per hour)^[1]. When 80% attribution is applied this comes to £23,300.

Efficiency

Barton Athletic are currently spending £51.27 per young person per year to maintain each of the groups listed in Table 2.

Gross cost of groups = £13,846

Less money charged to groups = £1,900

Net cost of groups = £11,946

Number of unique attendees = 233

Cost per unique attendee per year = £51.27

Effectiveness

Improved health and physical fitness was an outcome common to all of the young people at Barton Athletic. The progress they make at this group is of equivalent efficacy and value to a low cost gym membership (valued at £300 per person per year). The value of the work to improve physical fitness at Barton Athletic is therefore estimated to be £69,900 per year². When 80% attribution is applied this comes to £55,920.

Equity

The location of the club, word of mouth promotion and the low prices make this club affordable to many young people in the local area. This has helped Barton Athletic to reach its target group with over 50% of its membership base comprising young people aged 0-25.

VfM summary – Barton Athletic Club

Net costs = £11,946

Total value added* = £79,220

Effective value generated = £67,274

*Economy and Effectiveness indicators

^[1] Unit cost database - E&S4.0 - GP - cost per hour, General Medical Services activity

² Global Value Exchange - Value of one years membership to a local low cost gym

4.3 Case study 3 – BINOH & Compass

4.3.1 Contextual information

BINOH's mission is to provide orthodox Jewish communities with the support they need to access appropriate advice and services. The organisation provides a wide range of advice and support services to enable individuals and communities to improve their life chances. Services range from benefits advice, employment, training and skills support, financial literacy, and social educational challenges and activities as well as advocacy support to help ensure correct educational and benefit support referrals.

BINOH acts as an umbrella organisation, under which sits its subsidiary 'Compass', which works with school-age Jewish children and under-fives to provide specialist, multi-disciplinary, professional support to children with additional and/or special educational needs (SEN) or support for those with autism. For Compass and its staff the aim is to enhance a child's learning, improve their self-esteem, and allow them to fulfil their full potential. Compass is 50% funded by BINOH and 50% by Salford Children's Services.

Compass is funded to work with all Jewish and Salford children who are either Salford residents or who attend an independent or local authority School in Salford. Compass can therefore be considered to be part of Salford's Learning and Support Service, and acts as an important liaison between the local authority and the Jewish community. The team work in close partnership with Salford Learning Support, alongside specialist education schools and colleges such as Chatsworth College and High School and Langden College etc.

Compass provides support through a fully qualified team comprising a Special Educational Consultant, Specialist Teaching Adviser, Educational Psychologist and Family Support Worker. The Specialist Teaching Adviser collaboratively devises individual programmes and work with class teachers and other professionals to deliver support one on one or in small groups. The support ranges from assistance with the core curriculum around numeracy and literacy, and support with social skills and Jewish studies (Kodesh). Compass's work also incorporates the support and mentoring of Learning Support Assistants (LSAs) to help them understand how to support the children that are part of Compass.

4.3.2 Activities

Compass was established 15 years ago as a partnership with Salford Children's Services to meet special educational needs in independent Jewish Schools. Compass works with children via schools and provides assessments which are then translated to produce a tailored educational programme delivered by Teaching Assistants within each school. The Specialist Teaching Adviser works directly with staff and parents to help ensure that each child receives the correct resources.

Compass also runs training sessions, workshops, and provides learning materials to help upskill staff and parents. The organisation offers the support of an Educational Psychologist every two weeks, for staff and parents to consult and to help build capacity within schools. Compass also provides family support by supporting parents and staff to access the right resources for each child via the Special Educational Needs Coordinators in their school.

For schools which are more advanced in their experience and level of support for children with special educational needs, Compass support development of strategic relationships with the local authority and provides additional capacity through staff training. Schools reported that Compass gave them support and a voice when it came to accessing wider support and funding. Schools also reported that Compass staff are extremely helpful, lovely and very easy to work with.

4.3.3 Inputs and outputs

Table 3: BINOH & Compass

Session	Number of attendees per session*	Number of unique 0-25's engaged per year*	Number of sessions per school year	Cost to run one session	Charge per attendee per session
Individual support sessions tailored to special educational need.	1	100	585	£45	Free

4.3.4 Outcomes

Through Compass's one to one support sessions they have consistently boosted the confidence, skills, and educational attainment of the children they work with. In this case study, the benefits are clearly two-fold, the positive impact upon the children is one element but the impact on the schools and their staff development is also significant. Compass have trained staff and supported them to apply for extra funding to make it easier for them to provide the extra support required to give the children an equal opportunity to their peers.

'We've been receiving support for a long time so we don't need as much intensive help. Instead BINOH have been very helpful in helping us to develop links and close working relationships with other organisations. This has been really important as we wouldn't be able to lobby as effectively for funding without them. Their support is all there in the background without them we wouldn't be at this position.'

Increased confidence

The support provided by the Advisory Support Teacher was reported to have boosted the confidence of both the pupil's and their learning support workers. The sessions have been developed to form part of a pupil's routine and are designed to be fun as well as educational. Consequently, pupils who lacked confidence outside the classroom, now look forward to these sessions and are more confident working outside of class.

'Change for them is not easy and they don't like going out of the classroom normally, but they're very happy to visit them. The time out makes them feel special, and they're proud that they get to go and they feel excited.'

The support from the Advisory Support Teacher is also reported to have benefited staff as they are able to receive specialist guidance which would not normally be available. This support is particularly important in reassuring the Learning and Support Workers regarding their skills and approach to working with children that require special support.

'At the sessions I can get some specialist guidance which I wouldn't be able to get from the school so it gives me more confidence. I really enjoy reading the books with my pupil.'

Improvement in educational attainment

The intensive support provided by the Advisory Support Teacher has directly contributed to the improved educational performance of pupil's with special educational needs. By providing support through specially designed educational games, activities, and additional resources tailored to the needs of the pupil, Learning Support Workers reported clear improvements in their pupil's skills and educational attainments thanks to Compass's support.

'The specialist expertise has been essential in helping my pupil learn to read and gain new skills. I don't think this would have happened without this support - there is a special way to teach children

with Down's Syndrome – it's a special technique. I wouldn't know how to go about teaching this way without that extra support.'

Improved skills

Learning Support Workers reported that the opportunity to work closely with the Advisory Support Teacher had helped them to progress and develop in their career. The collegial relationship reported between the two workers helped to instil confidence but also enabled them to master particular skills and new techniques to develop their approach to teaching. Support Workers also reported how the regularity of the sessions helped them to structure their work with their pupil throughout the week and manage their own development and performance.

'The Advisory Support Teacher also organises evening classes which I've found really useful in my development, as they've helped me learn new techniques and skills which have helped with my teaching.'

4.3.5 Other VfM and wider considerations

Attribution

Compass is completely unique in Salford due to its specialist skills and expertise in working with orthodox Jewish communities. No other group provides tailored educational support for pupils within independent Jewish religious schools. Compass are able to provide specialist support and resources to Learning Support Workers and work with them to enhance the learning experience and outcomes of children with special educational needs. However, as we were unable to ascertain the wider services supporting each child we have assumed an 80% attribution rate to account for such impacts.

Economy

Looking specifically at the special needs pupils supported by Compass, the total cost saving to the public purse can be aligned to the number of children that may have required access to a school-based emotional learning programme if this group was not available.

Assuming all 100 attendees currently receiving support from Compass continue to do so throughout their time at school. We can estimate a cost saving of £14,800 per year (based on the cost of £148 per child per year for access to a school-based emotional learning programme)³. When the attribution rate of 80% is applied, this figure comes to £11,840.

Efficiency

Compass are currently spending £263.25 per young person per year to provide the one on one sessions listed in Table 3. However, as discussed Compass also provide teacher training (at a cost of £53,675 per annum). Despite not being directly spent on 0-25's, this spend is a crucial part of how Compass make the one on one sessions so effective for young people. The cost of teacher training will therefore be included in the following Efficiency calculation.

Gross cost of groups (and teacher training) = £26,325 (£53,675)

Less money charged to groups = £0

Net cost of groups and teacher training = £80,000

Number of unique attendees = 100

Cost per unique attendee per year = £800

Effectiveness

Improved educational attainment was an outcome common amongst young people engaged with Compass. The progress they make at this group is of equivalent efficacy and value to Special Educational Need (SEN) support for children in education valued at £2,947 per person per year. The value of the work to improve educational attainment is therefore estimated to be £294,700 per year⁴. When the attribution rate of 80% is applied, this figure comes to £235,760.

³ Unit cost database - E&S4.0 - School-based emotional learning programme - cost of delivery, per child per year

⁴ Global Value Exchange - Special Educational Need (SEN) support for children in education (change in)

Equity

Compass relies on referrals from local schools (where a child in need is identified) or from word of mouth and proactive advertising in orthodox Jewish communities. To that end BINOH and Compass are effectively reaching their target group.

VfM summary – BINOH & Compass

Net costs = £80,000

Total value added* = £247,600

Effective value generated = £167,600

*Economy and Effectiveness indicators

4.4 Case study 4 – Community Social Inclusion Network

4.4.1 Contextual information

Community Social Inclusion Network (CSIN) was set up by Joe and Jenny in 2014, more recently they established themselves as a community interest company based at ANTZ junction in Clifton. CSIN works to remove barriers to employment and tackle social injustice by giving disadvantaged young people and those with disabilities in Salford the tools and the confidence to combat social exclusion. They pride themselves on building programmes tailored to each persons needs.

There are several groups at CSIN that are all routes to improved confidence, new skills and empowerment. These groups include three different levels of broadcast radio education and a money matters course. All courses are hosted in an accepting and positive environment to aid the building of confidence and growing of practical and social skills.

4.4.2 Activities

CSIN host 4 sessions aimed at 0-25's, three are focussed on learning skills to broadcast on the radio and the other is a money matters course.

- Radio broadcast
 The radio broadcast sessions come in three phases, each earning the attendee a new qualification. These sessions are run by a professional teacher that maintains a relaxed and cooperative environment allowing attendees to learn in their own way. The sessions build up to the young people hosting their own radio show. Three participants started using their new skills to begin pre-recording their new show 'JAM' which went live in late February 2017. One of the participants at this session has begun to volunteer for CSIN and is currently in training to become a member of paid staff.
- Money Matters
 This group helps young people to understand their money, debt and how to budget appropriately. Joe also helps attendees with their CV's to help them find work.

4.4.3 Inputs and outputs

The majority of CSIN's funding comes directly from their own pockets. They would like to have more grant funding to support their work but the long and complex application process is inhibitive.

Table 4: Community Social Inclusion Network

Session	Number of attendees per session*	Number of unique 0-25's engaged per year*	Number of sessions per year	Cost to run one session	Charge per attendee per session
First steps to broadcast media	10	42	30	£52	Free
News broadcast	12		30	£52	Free
Radio broadcast	15		30	£52	Free
Money matters	6	18	8	£80	Free

* Where organisations have been unable to provide figures for 0-25's only we have used data available for all ages and asked them to estimate the % of 0-25's in attendance

4.4.4 Outcomes

At CSIN all attendees interviewed reported increased confidence, happiness and new skills. The Radio Broadcast sessions felt familial, all attendees get on well with each other and have a warm relationship with Joe and Jenny further helping them to grow their social skills in a comfortable environment.

Increased confidence

At the radio broadcast group, the confidence of one young man with downs syndrome has flourished so much, he now likes to be known as 'the boss'. He started at the group six months ago and has flown through the first level of the Radio broadcast sessions after spending some time working with Joe at Salford City Radio. He's very excited about starting level two in the next few months.

Two other young men were also enthusiastic about the JAM project and were looking forward to playing their songs.

Improved sense of wellbeing

One of the new hosts of 'JAM' reported a clear change in his personal outlook since coming along to the radio broadcast sessions at CSIN;

'I felt sorry, down and depressed before I came here. But now I'm hooked on the course – the certificates really work!'

The radio broadcast sessions alone have lifted this young man out of social isolation and built up his skills and confidence to see his sense of wellbeing grow.

Increased employability

Every session at CSIN boosts the employability of the individual in attendance, whether that is through building new social skills, learning the technicalities of radio broadcast or acquiring basic skills like learning how to read and write.

'Before he came here he could only read and write in Hebrew – now he's typing up posters for our wall in English'

This young man has thrived at CSIN and is now regularly volunteering for them for 3 days a week with a view to becoming a member of paid staff sometime soon.

4.4.5 Other VfM and wider considerations

Attribution

CSIN say they are there for those that the system has failed. Many of their attendees have worked with other services in the past but none seem to have been able to get the same results CSIN has. With that in mind, we can assume that the progress made by attendees is 90% attributable to CSIN, allowing 10% for support from family members and other unknown organisations.

Economy

As all young people at CSIN are studying they are no longer classed as NEET. The total cost saving to the public purse from the work of CSIN can therefore be aligned to the average cost of one young person becoming NEET (£4,637 per year). So we can estimate the total value saved per year is £278,220⁵. When the attribution rate of 90% is applied this figure comes to £250,398.

Efficiency

CSIN are currently spending £89 per young person per year to maintain each of the groups listed in Table 4.

Gross cost of groups = £5,320

Less money charged to groups = £0

Net cost of groups = £5,320

Number of unique attendees = 60

Cost per unique attendee per year = £89

⁵ Unit Cost database - E&E10.0 - Not in Employment Education or Training (NEET) - Average cost per 18-24 year old NEET

Effectiveness

Improved self-esteem was a clear outcome for all attendees at CSIN. The unique way they have designed their programme has allowed this outcome to flow naturally from the learning they are providing. The cost of a course to improve self-esteem currently sits at £214 per person per year⁶. The value of the work to improve self-esteem at CSIN can therefore be estimated at £12,840 per year. Accounting for the 90% attribution, the figure comes to £11,556.

Equity

CSIN set out to help disadvantaged young people in the local area to break through their social isolation by giving them the tools to tackle social exclusion. In this sense CSIN are achieving their objectives. However, the sessions are currently very male dominated. Joe wants to broaden the diversity of the groups CSIN provides, but limited funds make it difficult to both advertise and hold sessions that might attract a broader group of disadvantaged young people.

VfM summary – Community Social Inclusion Network

Net costs = £5,320

Total value added* = £261,954

Effective value generated = £256,634

*Economy and Effectiveness indicators

⁶ <http://www.globalvaluexchange.org/valuations/8279e41d9e5e0bd8499f28f8>

4.5 Case study 5 – Manchester Giants Netball

4.5.1 Contextual information

The Manchester Giants are a netball club operating in the Eccles area of Salford. They have three age groups which train regularly on a Thursday evening at Salford city college. The age groups include two teams for school age children covering years 5 to 11 (aged 9 to 16) and one team for mums looking to get back into netball. As well as training, the club looks to arrange competitive matches and participate in leagues across Greater Manchester.

The netball club has a range of objectives including; improving health and well-being; providing a space for children and young people to interact; and to develop the social skills of the individuals involved.

4.5.2 Activities

The club operates on a membership basis with the training taking place in 3 sessions over three hours on a Thursday evening. We dropped in on the last session between 8:15 and 9:15pm for 13 to 16 year olds.

The netball club has faced a difficult 12 months with the resignation of the previous committee. A new chair has however reinvigorated the club and they are looking to secure external funding to further their development. The club also undertakes a range of additional social and charitable activities, on top of the training and tournaments.

The club has regular team nights at Nando's and undertake bag packing activities in local shops. They have an affiliation with Manchester Giants basketball team and benefit from reduced price tickets.

The club faces a couple of key challenges moving forward. The first is around funding. The club would eventually like its own facilities which would enable them to do much more. The second is around reach, with the club wanting to engage young people from a broader set of schools.

4.5.3 Inputs and outputs

Each member pays £20 per month directly to Manchester Giants with an annual payment of £20 to England netball for each individual to cover insurance. For their membership fee, members receive access to training sessions, a coach, a dress, a jumper and associate membership of the Manchester Giants basketball team. The club also charges a £4 match fee for competitive games.

The core cost for this group is the hire of the sports hall for three hours at £240 per week. The club also pays a coach £50 per week, with additional costs for uniforms and equipment. Currently there are 90 girls registered with the club, approximately 32 attend each week and pay the full subscription.

Table 5: Manchester Giants Netball

Session	Number of attendees per session*	Number of unique 0-25's engaged per year*	Number of sessions per year	Cost to run one session	Charge per attendee per session
Netball training	32	90	42	£290	£5

* Where organisations have been unable to provide figures for 0-25's only we have used data available for all ages and asked them to estimate the % of 0-25's in attendance

4.5.4 Outcomes

At Manchester Giants, the most notable outcomes are improved confidence, improved self-esteem and heightened levels of fitness from learning a new game and regularly playing as part of a functional team.

Increased confidence

Players at Manchester Giants reported improved confidence since they joined the club. They attributed this to being part of a cohesive and successful team, and being able to play in an environment in which they feel comfortable and able to develop their skills.

'I like playing netball and I am meeting new people all the time and developing new skills'

Increased self-esteem

The club has led to improved educational attainment and has taught the girls leadership, mentoring and discipline skills. The older girls in particular are getting involved in coaching and mentoring the younger girls. The increased confidence and focus is having a noticeable impact on their engagement at school and college.

'I have come out of my shell and I am teaching the younger girls to play netball. They respect me which is nice.'

The club also helps to bring together parents as they are encouraged to attend training sessions and presentation evenings.

Improved health and wellbeing

The club leads to improved health and wellbeing amongst the girls. When the girls start at the group they arrive with different levels of fitness and technical netball ability, but together at the training sessions they work to improve their game.

'At school we just play a game; here it is different. I am feeling a lot fitter'

The social aspect is a really important element of the club for those involved. Many of the girls meet up outside of the Manchester Giants group to socialise in their own time. A few girls also mentioned the inspiration that the Manchester Giants basketball team is, highlighting the importance of the link between the two groups in spurring the girls on to achieve more.

'I look up to them and what they have achieved and aspire to be a professional one day.'

4.5.5 Other VfM and wider considerations**Attribution**

Manchester Giants Netball is unique to Eccles. It provides the girls with a safe space and a shared purpose facilitating the formation of relationships and increasing levels of confidence. Whilst some of the girls involved play netball at school, the girls attribute the vast majority of their outcomes to the club as a result of the social activities also involved. The chair of the club and the coach agree that approximately 80% of the outcomes listed above is attributable to Manchester Giants.

Economy

Manchester Giants Netball is teaching young women to play together effectively and maintain an active and social lifestyle that keeps their weight at a healthy level. The estimated value of adopting a healthier lifestyle to avoid obesity per person per year is £485⁷. Assuming all unique attendees keep up their attendance for a full year and maintain their healthy lifestyle the potential value of this is an estimated £43,650. When 80% attribution is applied this figure becomes £34,920.

Efficiency

The Manchester Giants Netball club are currently spending £91.33 per young person per year to maintain each of the groups listed in table 5.

Gross cost of groups = £15,900

Less money charged to groups = £7,680 (based on 32 regular attendees)

Net cost = £8,220

Number of unique attendees = 90

Cost per unique attendee per year = £91.33

⁷ Global Value Exchange - Weight loss costs; years of life saved from being a healthy weight

Effectiveness

Whilst there are significant outcomes for the players such as confidence development and improved social skills, it is also important to highlight the important impact of the club on those that run it. Two under 25s regularly volunteer in organising and running the sessions and coaching; and in developing the social activities. The value of volunteering can be estimated to be £3,248.82 per person per annum meaning an estimated impact from the two volunteers at Manchester Giants Netball is equal to £6,497.64. Accounting for attribution this figure comes to £5,198.11⁸.

Equity

The club is cohesive in its approach and looks to include everyone. One example is the integration of two young girls from traditional Jewish backgrounds with other communities.

'Normally I would just do stuff in the Jewish community. I really like making new friends from across the city.'

The current membership of Manchester Giants Netball is largely drawn from middle class families reflecting the costs associated with subscriptions and other activities. The group is seeking to diversify through further engagement with schools and is looking to secure sponsorship to support the membership of some individuals less able to afford the fees from deprived communities in Salford.

VfM summary – Manchester Giants Netball

Net costs = £8,220

Total value added* = £40,118

Effective value generated = £31,898

*Economy and Effectiveness indicators

⁸ Global Value Exchange - Regular volunteering (value to an individual of unknown age and unknown geographical location in the UK, per annum)

4.6 Case study 6 – Mums’ and Dads’ Club

4.6.1 Contextual information

Salford Mum’s and Dad’s club is based at Fiddlers Lane Primary School, and is a free club open to Parents, Carers, Grandparents, Aunts and Uncles who want to involve their children in a range of fun activities from 1:45 – 3:15 pm every Friday. At the club both parents and children have the opportunity to participate in arts and crafts, games, cooking activities, and festivals. The club also teaches parents and their children to recycle materials and everyday objects into art projects.

The club aims to bring children and their guardians together for social time to improve relationships, provide quality time, provide a creative outlet for children, and ensure access to cheap creative activities. By delivering the club during school time, Mum’s and Dad’s club provides parents who are unable to access after school clubs with the opportunity to spend one on one time with their child, helping them to develop stronger emotional bonds and improve the communication skills of both parents and children. The club places a ban on mobile phones and other electronics to ensure full attention on interaction.

The club has been running for 3 years and has grown in number year on year, it is now very popular with parents and pupils alike. As a result of the increased parental engagement with the school a PTA has now been established.

4.6.2 Inputs and outputs

Mums’ and Dads’ club has an average of 35 attendees per session. The £583 it costs to operate the club is provided by grants from the Little Pot of Health Innovation.

Table 6: Mums’ and Dads’ Club

Session	Number of attendees per session* (include pupil’s/parents)	Number of unique 0-25’s engaged per year*	Number of sessions per year	Cost to run one session	Charge per attendee per session
Mum’s and Dad’s Club	35	20 (Estimated)	25	£23.32	Free

4.6.3 Outcomes

Both parents and pupils experienced a number of positive outcomes including increased confidence, improved family relationships and a boost in educational attainment/school readiness.

Increased confidence

By supporting parents to interact in a fun, safe environment within the school, the club has helped parents to get to know other parents and teachers. Over time this has enabled parents to build new relationships with school staff and personal friendships, which has helped parents gain the confidence to get involved at the school. This has resulted in parents setting up a new PTA. This is particularly important as many parents may not have had positive experiences of school, so the Mum’s and Dad’s club provides an important contrast to these experiences.

‘It’s been helpful in building relationships with the school, we’re relatively new to the area so it’s been helpful in making connections. It also helps me to understand her school life.’

‘I’m glad that we came as it’s gotten me involved in the PTA, because I’ve got to know the school and teachers so I’m up to date with all the activities. It was down to the Club that I got involved.’

Improvement in family relationships

By providing an informal environment parents and pupils are given important time to interact and create fun and interesting crafts. All of the parents and children interviewed highlighted the importance of this time together away from distractions. Many parents commented that finding one on one time at home could be difficult due to work commitments, technological distractions, or the need to balance

their time with their other children. Parents also reported that this quality time had helped to improve communication with their child and their overall relationship.

'I get one on one time with her as she has another sibling at home who has ADHD so it can be hard to spend quality time without distractions.'

Improvement in school readiness and educational attainment

The majority of parents interviewed reported that they felt the club had helped to improve their child's concentration, behaviour and subsequent attainment at school. This was attributed to the increased opportunity to socialise with other children outside of the classroom, the concentration required to work creatively and the opportunity to acquire new skills through a variety of different activities. Teachers and learning support staff echoed these sentiments and noted that there was a clear progression in the behaviour and key skills of children who attended the club, which was particularly notable at key stage 1.

'He has better interactions with me and the other children, it's helped him grow up bit and it's improved his concentration because before he would just run around but now he settles to the activities.'

4.6.4 Other VfM and wider considerations

Attribution

Mums' and Dads' club is unique in the local area as it is the only club where parents can do arts and crafts activities with their children during school time. No other group we are aware of provides a similar environment for young people to spend time with their siblings and parents. As such we have estimated an 80% attribution rate, the remaining 20% accounts for other unknown groups and sources of support for the families.

Economy

Improved social skills was an outcome common to each of the pupils at the Mums' and Dads' Club. Assuming all 20 attendees age 0-25 currently attending the group stay with Mums' and Dads' Club for a full year we can estimate a cost saving of £2,960 per year (based on the cost of £148 per child per year for access to a school based emotional learning programme)^[1]. Once the 80% attribution rate is applied this figure comes to £2,368.

Efficiency

Salford Mums' and Dads' Club are currently spending £29.15 per young person per year to maintain each of the groups listed in Table 6.

Gross cost of groups = £583

Less money charged to groups = £0

Net cost of groups = £583

Number of unique attendees = 20

Cost per unique attendee per year = £29.15

Effectiveness

A further outcome common to all attendees was noticeable improvement in their educational attainment, this was far less likely to happen if this group was not available.

It can therefore be assumed that the progress they make at this group is of equivalent efficacy and value to a change in Education for individuals (valued at £233.27 per person per year) resulting in a projected difference in earning between individuals with NVQ level 3 and NVQ level 1 qualifications. The value of the work to improve school readiness at the Club is therefore an estimated £4,665 per year⁹. Once the 80% attribution rate is applied this figure comes to £3,732.

^[1] Unit cost database - E&S4.0 - School-based emotional learning programme - cost of delivery, per child per year

⁹ Global Value Exchange - Education (change in)

Equity

Mums' and Dads' Club relies heavily on word-of-mouth and advertising through the school to let people know what they do. Fiddler's Lane Primary School is located in a deprived area, and additional activities such as the Mums' and Dads' Club have been introduced to help parents become more involved in their child's education and to enhance pupil's educational experience. However, whilst the club supports children with complex needs, the club is open to children of all abilities and therefore could be considered to be effectively reaching its target group e.g. pupils and their parents.

VfM summary – Mums' and Dads' Club

Net costs = £583

Total value added* = £6,100

Effective value generated = £5,517

*Economy and Effectiveness indicators

4.7 Case study 7 – Positive Moves

4.7.1 Contextual information

Positive Moves was established in Cadishead in 2006 by Sylvia McDowell to support disadvantaged and vulnerable young people in the community. Since 2006 she has continued to expand the level of support and number of groups Positive Moves offers. On different nights of the week Positive Moves hosts separate groups to support children with special needs and their siblings, young women and young people with mental health conditions. Sylvia's links with schools, doctors, special educational needs (SEN) teams and child and adolescent mental health services (CAMHS) mean that children that require the support her group is able to provide are referred at the right time.

For each of the groups Sylvia hosts she is aiming to increase the confidence and happiness of those attending. For the special needs group in particular she aims to make sibling relationships richer and stronger and broaden each child's network of friends.

Positive Moves is entirely dependent on annual grant funding. Recently Sylvia has found herself being outcompeted by much larger national charities that are unable to offer the bespoke locally integrated service she is able to provide. If Positive Moves is unsuccessful with a grant application the associated project must come to an end, as staffing, admin and room rental costs cannot be covered.

4.7.2 Activities

Positive Moves currently runs three group sessions for people aged 0-25. Below is a brief overview of each group.

Special needs group

This group aims to build stronger bonds between siblings where at least one child has special needs. The group is hosted in a local community centre which Sylvia rents for each session. Currently 26 young people attend with ages ranging from 5 through to 18.

The community centre is filled with games, computers, table tennis, pool, arts & crafts, music and food for the session. The group is intentionally informal with a few paid staff and volunteers allowing a safe fun space for siblings to play and make friends with other young people. Parents have told Sylvia they've seen big improvements in their children's behaviour and their ability to handle emotions since they joined Positive Moves. Sylvia is looking into setting up a formal advice session for parents struggling to deal with difficult behaviour, lack of sleep and getting their children in to school. Sylvia is currently doing this on an informal basis but it's taking too much of her time away from the Special needs group.

Young women's group

The young women's group aims to provide respite and support for disadvantaged young women in Irlam and Cadishead. This group has 10 regular attendees and acts as an ongoing support group to boost the confidence and self-esteem of these young women by talking through their expectations for the future and helping them to understand how they can set and achieve realistic objectives.

Mental health project

This is the newest of all the projects run by Positive Moves. The project currently helps 5 young people that are NEET and/or have mental health problems to make the right education and training choices so they have the best possible chance of succeeding in the future. This project is unique in the way the support is built around the needs of the individual as oppose to a standard programme of generic support.

4.7.3 Inputs and outputs

It costs just under £50,000 to run Positive Moves for one year. All of this money is sourced from grants. Unfortunately, Positive Moves has only been able to secure funding for one year at a time meaning if they are unsuccessful for a bid one year, a group may have to be abruptly discontinued.

Table 7: Positive Moves

Session	Number of attendees per session*	Number of unique 0-25's engaged per year*	Number of sessions per year	Cost to run one session	Charge per attendee per session
Special needs group	26	31	50	£330	£1
Young women	10	10	50	£330	Free
Mental health project	5	5	50	£330	Free

* Where organisations have been unable to provide figures for 0-25's only we have used data available for all ages and asked them to estimate the % of 0-25's in attendance

4.7.4 Outcomes

The community hall where the special needs group is held had a buzzy welcoming atmosphere, the young people were clearly very comfortable at the group and enjoying their time. In the time we spent with the Special needs group we spoke with Sylvia and a few of the attendees, a teenage girl with special needs attending alone and a young boy with special needs and his teenage sister.

From the conversation we had it was clear that the outcomes Sylvia is aiming for were being achieved;

Improved self esteem

The majority of the conversation on our visit was held between laughs and giggles induced by the young boy's excellent impression of a dinosaur. His older sister told us 'he's far more confident' since they both started to attend in February 2016, 'he's really come out of his shell'. Her younger sibling told us between dinosaur noises he would 'just be at home' if he didn't come to Positive Moves and that he 'really liked it'. It appears that he may not have enjoyed coming into a group full of strangers at first but overtime he has adjusted and is treating the group like a set of very close friends.

Stronger interpersonal skills and relationships

The young boy's older sister went on to tell us that 'she knows how they are more', referring to her two brothers with special needs that both attend the session with her. She told us that it has given them a 'broad people experience', it is clear that the group has boosted their confidence and grown their network of friends allowing them to take part in many more social interactions and get to know some of the people around them.

Ability to process emotion

Activities at the group and the regularity of social interaction with a group and individuals is helping young people to learn how to communicate and keep a handle on their own emotions. This in turn has helped to ease pressures at home and strengthen family networks naturally. Whilst parents dropping their children off at the group gives them a couple of hours of respite.

4.7.5 Other VfM and wider considerations

Attribution

Positive Moves is completely unique in Cadishead in its offer. No other group provides a similar environment for young people with special needs to spend time with their siblings and other children in similar situations. Positive Moves recently lost a grant for a project they'd been running to a big national company. The company chose to provide their services in one centre in Warrington which was too far for most to travel meaning young people and families were cut off from support. As such we estimate the attribution for Positive Moves to be 90% to account for any unknown external support.

Economy

Looking specifically at the special needs group at Positive Moves, the total cost saving to the public purse can be aligned to the number of children that may have required access to a school-based emotional learning programme if this group was not available.

Assuming all 26 attendees currently attending the group stay with Positive move for a full year (most stay longer) we can estimate a cost saving to the public purse of £3,848 per year (based on the cost of £148 per child per year for access to a school-based emotional learning programme)¹⁰. When the attribution rate of 90% is applied this figure comes to £3,463.

Efficiency

Positive moves are currently spending £1,048 per young person per year to maintain each of the groups listed in Table 7.

Gross cost of groups = £49,500

Less money charged to groups = £1,300

Net cost of groups = £48,200

Number of unique attendees = 46

Cost per unique attendee per year = £1,048

Effectiveness

Improved self-esteem was an outcome common to each of the groups at Positive Moves. The progress they make at this group is of equivalent efficacy and value to a self-esteem course (valued at £1,195 per person per year). The value of the work to improve self-esteem at Positive Moves can therefore be estimated at £54,970 per year. When the attribution rate of 90% is applied this figure comes to £49,473.¹¹

Equity

Positive Moves relies to some extent on word-of-mouth to let people know what they do and how to access their services, they also have a website and a Facebook page with over 800 followers. However, mostly they rely on referrals from local schools where a child in need is identified. To that end Positive Moves is effectively reaching its target group and is representative of the population of the area. The gender and age balance in the special needs group is notable, with few children from ethnic minorities but this is a feature of the demographics in the area where 95% of residents are white.¹²

VfM summary – Positive Moves

Net costs = £48,200

Total value added* = £52,936

Effective value generated = £4,736

*Economy and Effectiveness indicators

¹⁰ Unit cost database - E&S4.0 - School-based emotional learning programme - cost of delivery, per child per year

¹¹ Global Value Exchange-Confidence (increase) for Person (Individuals), cost of confidence training

¹² DC2101EW - Ethnic group by sex by age - Cadishead

4.8 Case study 8 – Salford Musical Youth

4.8.1 Contextual information

Salford Musical Youth have been delivering activities as a group since 2014. It is a volunteer led community project which provides an opportunity for young people to learn music and express themselves in a safe place with likeminded people. The project is aimed at people aged between 11 and 25 and provides access to a range of music tutors and the opportunity to learn how to play instruments, learn performance skills, how to set up performance equipment and the basics of sound engineering. This is all put to use in live music shows.

4.8.2 Activities

Activities are delivered every week with a session on a Wednesday evening between 6pm and 8pm, with live performances every few months. Tutors offer lessons for guitar, bass, vocals, drums, production, song writing and performance. Guitarists can learn everything from basic chords, picking and strumming to soloing techniques and advanced rhythm. Bassists learn technique, dexterity, and scales as well as tips for improvisational playing. Drummers learn everything from timing and rhythm exercises to more complicated beats and solo techniques, while singers learn skills to improve their delivery and enhance their voices and vocal range.

Participants have an opportunity to learn the behind the scenes professional production techniques, spending time in a studio recording their own songs, and have gone on to produce their own music video with the support of students from Salford University, recording in the iconic Victoria Baths. The group have visited the Cavern in Liverpool to round off their musical education and have recently purchased a street amp, with plans to do some busking in central Manchester.

The groups most successful band, Operation Detonation or OpDet was formed around 2.5 years ago and has gone from strength to strength. They recently performed at the O2 Academy in Leeds in the finals of the SoundWaves Music Competition, the largest music competition platform for unsigned artists. The band made it through four rounds of competition and live auditions to make the final line up from over 300 original entries and they were by far the youngest to perform. Their success attracted local media interest, with the band being interviewed on local TV channel, That's Manchester. Previous and upcoming performances include:

- ❑ Festwich – 2 day festival in Prestwich – open mic;
- ❑ Salford Music Festival 2016 – Salford Arms;
- ❑ The Star community pub in Salford;
- ❑ Alan Henning Fundraiser;
- ❑ Band on the Wall – Battle of the Bands (upcoming).

4.8.3 Inputs and outputs

Salford Musical Youth have received £5,000 in grant funding but are heavily reliant on parental volunteers, with one volunteer able to offer use of a van for transporting musical equipment such as amps, an acoustic drum set, a stage and a tent. Without this free transport, the costs of vehicle hire would be prohibitive for the group.

Historically the project had attracted between 12-15 participants per week, however over the past year attendance has dropped with a core group now of between 4 and 5 young people. The project moved to its current location around 12 months ago and has lost some of its membership as a result. There have also been some issues with the consistency with which tutors have been able to work with the group, but a new vocal tutor and instrument tutor are lined up for February 2017.

Some equipment is purchased by the group while other equipment has kindly been donated by Salford college. The venue costs amount to £1,250 per year and Tutors are paid £30 per hour.

Table 8: Salford Musical Youth

Session	Number of attendees per session*	Number of unique 0-25's engaged per year*	Number of sessions per year	Cost to run one session	Charge per attendee per session
Wednesday night	4/5	5	50	£25-55	£3.50
Saturday morning	4/5		30-40	£0	£0
Gigs/performances	4/5		7-10	£0	£0

4.8.4 Outcomes

The young people attending this group all credit it with helping them to learn new skills and boost their confidence through playing regular gigs. The leaders of the group also reported that attendees are better able to deal with issues they are facing in their lives since they started coming to this session as it allows them to focus, gives them access to a different support network and in some cases provides them with an opportunity to mentor other young people.

Vital skills for a music education

A musical education and the ability to play an instrument is something that stays with you for life, and many of the group are pursuing more formal music education at school and college. One member has taken her music GCSE early, meaning she can take an additional GCSE subject at school. All members are either attending music college or planning on doing so, with core members attending FutureSkills at Media City, part of Salford College and the Access to Music College in Manchester.

'I have attended on and off for the past 5 years, it gives me a space to jam and practice as a band, we get loads of opportunity to perform. I guess it got me interested in sound engineering which I'm doing at college now'

'He was having a difficult time at school with poor attendance, but always attended here on a Wednesday, and he got a distinction in Music, helping him into the FutureSkills college at Media City'

Increased confidence

The opportunity to perform in front of ever increasing audiences is providing a boost to the confidence of all involved, with performances at local festivals, fund raising events and the recent performance on the big stage at the O2 Academy the highlight of their performance career to date. A performance for the city council is scheduled for later in the month, something they're now excited about instead of apprehensive.

'She had only played the drums twice before joining the group, but was performing within 2 weeks, she has really gained from the confidence. Her teachers have really noticed a change in her'

'Boy did they put on a show [at the O2 Academy], the room became alive when they started to perform, people whistling, shouting and joining in and shouting 'MORE' when they'd finished, it was absolutely electrifying'

Self-awareness

The sessions provide the young people with a safe place to deal with any issues they may be facing with a close-knit group. The group offers and volunteers offering emotional, health and wellbeing support through creative activity, in an area of high need. The young people who participate mentor new members and take them under their wing, showing positive experiences from being in a group.

4.8.5 Other VfM and wider considerations

Attribution

Salford Musical Youth, while unique, provides a similar experience to a more structured music group called MAPAS established at Moorside school, however young people tend to be attracted to this group as a more relaxed alternative. Those attending music college will also be benefiting from similar

outcomes as part of their formal education. As such their attribution is estimated to be around 50% to allow for the impact of their formal education elsewhere.

Economy

While the young people who attend Salford Musical Youth may be at risk of lower confidence and less well developed music skills if the group was unavailable. It is not assumed that in the groups absence that the young people in attendance would incur a cost to the public purse. For Salford Musical Youth the real value is in their Effectiveness, exposing young people to experiences that build their confidence and in teaching them the skills they need to access and excel in musical college courses.

Efficiency

The cost of running Salford Musical Youth is largely dependent on the number of tuition weeks delivered as this is variable, while the venue costs are fixed. Based on the previous year Salford Musical Youth are currently spending £655.60 per young person per year to maintain each of the sessions listed in Table 8.

Gross cost = £4,000 (assuming 50 weeks tuition)

Less money charged to groups = £672 (based on 192 attendances counted from the register)

Net cost = £3,328

Number of unique attendees = 5

Cost per unique attendee per year = £665.60

Effectiveness

The confidence that the young people gain from attending this group and performing is of equivalent efficacy and value to a young person's Self-Confidence and Assertiveness training course (valued at £1,195 per person)¹³. The value of the work at Salford Musical Youth to boost confidence is therefore an estimated £5,975. When the attribution rate of 50% is applied this value comes to £2,987.50.

Equity

While Salford Musical Youth has been running for a number of years, the change of venue a year ago has reduced the size of their membership. The group, run by volunteers, requires some additional support in marketing Salford Musical Youth to new members, ensuring a consistent programme of tuition over the year and also looking to engage with local businesses as sponsors to reduce costs of new music equipment.

VfM summary – Salford Musical Youth

Net costs = £3,328

Total value added* = £2,988

Effective value generated = £--¹⁴

*Economy and Effectiveness indicators

¹³ Global Value Exchange-Confidence (increase) for Person (Individuals), cost of confidence training

¹⁴ As Salford Musical Youth spend more money to run the group than the value they generate (based on selected assessed outcomes) their effective value generated is deemed to be £nil as oppose to a negative figure.

4.9 Case study 9 – Salford Wheels for All

4.9.1 Contextual information

Salford Wheels for All is a group that offers adapted cycles for all young people, with specific focus on providing their services to children and adults with disabilities. They started 25 years ago in 1991 and are one of 50 'Wheels for All' groups in the UK, each responsible for their own funding. Salford Wheels for All has gone from strength to strength in recent years growing in number of sessions available and attendees.

Wheels for All staff have forged strong relationships with schools and other local groups such as the Stroke Association, Special Spirits and Salford Action for Autism to make their cycles available to all those that would like to use them. Aside from learning how to ride a bike, Salford Wheels for All tackles a variety of issues facing young people in Salford including poor health and wellbeing (obesity, lack of fitness, loneliness) and low confidence and self-esteem (poor social skills).

4.9.2 Activities

Salford Wheels for All runs 5 types of sessions per year;

Public sessions (Wednesday, Friday, Saturday)

These sessions take place at Cleavley Athletic Track where 20+ bikes are provided for attendees to ride around the track. This group is open to all that choose to attend, at weekends and school holidays most attendees are aged between 0-25.

Saturday afternoon (for children with Autism)

This group is a joint venture between Cath and Scott at Salford Wheels for All and Kay at Salford Action for Autism. This group is held at the same athletic track as the public sessions but only open to children with autism and their family and friends. This unique session is built around a rigid structure in the afternoon to make autistic children more relaxed and provides a safe place for them to play while their parents are able to tap into Kay's support and advice.

School visits (local Springwood Primary School)

Whilst these visits only happen twice a year, they are a special event for Springwood Primary School. Wheels for All take their cycles over to Springwood Primary to allow children in every year group to try riding one of their specially adapted cycles.

Red pepper (to tackle obesity)

These sessions are run in six week cycles in partnership with Salford Health Improvement Service and are accessed through referrals. This session provides a safe space for overweight people to learn how to ride a bike and meet people facing similar challenges.

Sunday afternoon (for Jewish children with disabilities)

To accommodate members of the local orthodox Jewish community with disabilities Wheels for All began to open Cleavley athletic track on a Sunday – an understanding of the surrounding community has allowed Wheels for All to make cycling accessible to a community that could have otherwise been excluded.

4.9.3 Inputs and outputs

Table 9: Salford Wheels for All

Session	Number of attendees per session*	Number of unique 0-25's engaged per year*	Number of sessions per year	Cost to run one session	Charge per attendee per session
Public sessions	8	380	144	£148	£3
Saturday afternoon Autism	20	20	40	£148	Free
School visits	60	60	2	£150	£150 (payable by the school)
Red Pepper	6	24	24	£30	£30 (payable by Salford City Council)
Sunday afternoon Jewish disability	25	25	12	£148	£3

* Where organisations have been unable to provide figures for 0-25's only we have used data available for all ages and asked them to estimate the % of 0-25's in attendance

4.9.4 Outcomes

Young people at Salford Wheels for All experience an improved sense of wellbeing, confidence and self-esteem and often experience an improvement in their health, the increased physical activity helps to maintain a healthy weight.

Health improvement

For each of the five sessions at Salford Wheels for All, health improvement is a universal benefit. For many attendees this is the first time they've ever ridden a bike. The father of a young girl with global developmental delay has seen unexpected results from bringing his daughter along to Salford Wheels for All sessions;

'With a big smile on her face she will ride confidently around the track up to 5 times, and this is a girl who can't walk without a walking frame! I have found her a special needs trike for home & she uses it a lot but without the sessions at the track she probably wouldn't be able to ride it yet.'

Improved sense of wellbeing

At the Saturday afternoon autism session it was clear that the attendees were enjoying themselves and time with other young friends. Building social skills and averting social isolation is crucial for autistic children who often suffer from low self-esteem, a generally poor sense of wellbeing and difficulty building relationships. The father of a 12 year old boy with Autism and Downs syndrome is grateful for the bonding time Salford Wheels for All provides;

'The activity is one of the very few things which he can genuinely enjoy together with me, as his autism means that he often prefers to be on his own, and just playing with his own toys or watching videos.'

Improved confidence and self-esteem

Learning how to ride a bike has a remarkable effect on a child's self-esteem. One Mother was so grateful for the careful encouragement and tuition from Salford Wheels for All that had given her daughter the confidence she needed;

'He took the pedals off her bike and showed her how to ride down a slope. Within two weeks she was able to balance...she now rides a two wheeler with no problems and it has massively boosted her self esteem and confidence. We are so grateful.'

The father of the young boy with Autism and Downs syndrome has also seen his son's confidence and self-esteem flourish at the same session;

'Initially, he needed an adult to walk alongside him to encourage him to pedal round. Over recent visits he's become confident enough to do a full circuit of the track on his own. On the last couple of visits he's even pedalled quite fast towards the end of his lap with some shouted encouragement. His smiling face as he pedals his bike back to complete a circuit is always a joy to see.'

4.9.5 Other VfM and wider considerations**Attribution**

Salford Wheels for All run a variety of groups on their own or on behalf of a wider organisation (Public sessions, school visits, the Sunday session and Red Pepper) and some in conjunction with partner organisations (Saturday afternoon group). For the sessions they run alone, an estimated 80% attribution will be applied to account for the support of the young people's parents and the use of cycles at home. For the Saturday afternoon club the attribution applied will be 40% as both Salford Wheels for All and Salford Action for Autism have equal contributions in terms of grant funding and recruiting young cyclists. The remaining 20% again will account for the support of the young people's parents and the use of cycles at home.

Economy

Focussing on the Saturday afternoon group for young people with Autism it can be estimated that this group adds value of £123 per person per session. This figure has been drawn from the cost listed for one session of Multi-Systemic Therapy (MST) in the unit cost database. MST is often used to help people with Autism learn how to manage their behaviour.

The annual value added by the Saturday afternoon group alone is therefore an estimated £98,400 (assuming one therapy session per child per week). With the 40% attribution rate applied this figure comes to £39,360.

Efficiency

Salford Wheels for All are currently spending £48.38 per young person per year to maintain each of the groups listed in Table 9.

Gross cost of groups = £30,000

Less money charged to groups = £5,376

Net cost of groups = £24,624

Number of unique attendees = 509

Cost per unique attendee per year = £48.38

Effectiveness

All sessions held by Salford Wheels for All help attendees to improve their physical fitness and manage their weight (excluding the school visits due to infrequency of sessions). The estimated value of adopting a healthier lifestyle to tackle obesity per person per year is £485.¹⁵ Assuming all attendees incorporate regular exercise over the course of their time at Salford Wheels for All the potential estimated value of this is £217,765. Accounting for 40% attribution for the Saturday afternoon club and 80% for the public sessions, the Sunday group and Red Pepper this value comes to £170,332.

¹⁵ <http://www.globalvaluexchange.org/valuations/8279e41d9e5e0bd8499f2b13>

Equity

Salford Wheels for All have worked hard to provide facilities and groups for people facing different challenges. The Saturday afternoon group for example is held on a Saturday afternoon to allow time for parents with Autistic children to go through their child's morning routines which can often be lengthy. They are also working towards becoming accredited under the Autism Education Trust (AET) standards which are usually reserved for schools, but they are making special arrangements to allow the Saturday afternoon group to become the first accredited Autism friendly cycling group.

In addition, Salford Wheels for All noticed there was a gap in provision for members of the orthodox Jewish community with disabilities, they started to run sessions on a Sunday to accommodate these young people as they are unable to attend on the Sabbath.

VfM summary – Salford Wheels for All

Net costs = £24,624

Total value added* = £209,692

Effective value generated = £185,068

*Economy and Effectiveness indicators

4.10 Case study 10 – Warm Hut

4.10.1 Contextual information

Warm Hut originally started as a self-help group for female asylum seekers and refugees in 2009. The women found it difficult to get the required support to deal with immigration queries, so they decided to come together and help each other. The women who founded the group came from French speaking African countries. Now Warm Hut is a registered charity, and supports individuals from a wide range of African countries, including those from Portuguese-speaking countries.

Warm Hut now works with all age ranges, with people from across Salford. Activities that Warm Hut provides include a women’s wellbeing group, which covers a broad range of issues, including emotional wellbeing and how to write a CV. Warm Hut also has provisions specifically for children.

4.10.2 Activities

Warm Hut runs homework clubs for children living in Salford, and has done so since 2013. There are three periods during the week that homework clubs are held. On Mondays and Wednesdays after school Warm Hut provides a homework club for secondary school pupils. This support is one-to-one, and predominantly attended by children transitioning from primary school to secondary school.

CLES visited the third group, the Saturday homework club, which supports primary school aged children. The teaching on Saturdays is in groups, typically there are three different classes of different aged children learning each week.

There is a waiting list to attend the homework clubs, all of which are led by professional teachers who have chosen to volunteer their time at Warm Hut. Outside of term time the homework club is ran as a youth club instead. Both clubs are free to attend.

4.10.3 Inputs and outputs

It costs £8,160 to maintain each of the sessions listed below for one year. In the past, this club has been funded from a variety of sources including grants and income from an after-school club. Recently Warm Hut received a grant that covers current running costs. There is plenty of demand for more spaces but as it stands the groups do not have the capacity to accommodate everybody.

Table 10: Warm Hut

Session	Number of attendees per week*	Number of unique 0-25's engaged per year*	Number of sessions per year	Cost to run weekly sessions	Charge per attendee per session
Monday and Wednesday one-to-one homework club sessions	18	36	78 (39 term time weeks x 2 sessions per week)	£185 (room hire + teacher payment)	£15
Saturday group homework club session	30	45	51	£200	Free

* Where organisations have been unable to provide figures for 0-25's only we have used data available for all ages and asked them to estimate the % of 0-25's in attendance

4.10.4 Outcomes

Improved school performance

The children reported improved performance at school as a consequence of attending the homework club. Many of the children were reported to have parents with limited English, so it was difficult for them to get help with school work when they were at home. Attending the homework club meant that they did not fall behind at school and sometimes they were able to outperform their peers.

'I enjoy it because there are a lot of good lessons, we get encouraged to do work so it is easier at school.'

'When I came here when I was Year 3, I learnt something first at Warm Hut and then learnt it at school and it was easier. Things like division and fractions, mostly maths.'

Larger social network

A key reason that many of the children enjoyed the homework club was that it gave them the opportunity to meet new people from different schools and strengthen friendships with their friends at their own school.

'It is better here than normal school because you get to know more people so you get more friends.'

'At school we know each other really well because we see each other here.'

Improved emotional wellbeing

The children really enjoyed attending the homework club, leading to increases in emotional wellbeing. The Warm Hut teacher volunteers ensured that the homework club was fun, with learning not always classroom-based.

'Sometimes we get to go to Peel Park. We climb up the rocks. We do a scavenger hunt and find things on a list.'

Much of the classroom-based learning also gave the children opportunities to do activities that they did not do regularly at school, such as work on computers. Snacks are provided, and the children look forward to the opportunity to eat with their friends during break.

'I like it because at break time I get to eat loads of food.'

When asked, the children explained that they would rather attend the homework club than do something else on their Saturdays.

4.10.5 Other VfM and wider considerations

Attribution

The long waiting list for Warm Hut's homework clubs is evidence of its uniqueness within Salford. To our knowledge, there are no other services that offer this support, and certainly none with a clear understanding of many of the challenges that children of migrant parents may face at school. Furthermore, when asked directly, it was clear that the children placed great value on how the homework club enabled them to improve their learning and social networks, often valuing it to a greater extent than other opportunities to improve these outcomes, such as school.

With the above considered, we estimate the attribution to Warm Hut to be 60%.

Economy

If the children were not able to attend the homework club, it can be assumed that their performance at school would suffer. This could in turn lead to poor behaviour in school, including truancy. Even if we take a highly conservative estimate that just 5% of the 81 unique attendees per year would miss at least five weeks of school over the course of one year, this would result in an estimated cost of £15,024 (8 children x £1,878¹⁶) with the cost assumed to be borne by a variety of organisations and agencies including the local authority and health agencies.

An application of 60% attribution to Warm Hut for averting this outcome brings this figure to £9,014.

¹⁶ Unit cost database – total cost of persistent truancy

Efficiency

It currently costs Warm Hut approximately £85 per child per year to run the homework club.

Gross cost of groups = £17,415

Less money charged to children = £10,530

Net cost of groups = £6,885

Number of unique attendees = 81

Cost per unique attendee per year = £85

Effectiveness

A key outcome at Warm Hut for the children was improved social networks, that resulted from the increased opportunity to spend time with friends and family associated with other schools. Powdthavee (2008)¹⁷ conducted an economic valuation that estimated that the value of moving from seeing friends or family once a month to seeing them approximately once a week (how often the children attend the homework club) was £14,800 per child.

£14,800 x 81 children gives a total value of £1,198,800. When the attribution figure of 60% is considered, this gives a total estimated value of £719,280.

Equity

The mission of Warm Hut is focused on the support of African people, and the homework clubs reach this target group, supporting greater inclusion of children from African backgrounds in the education system. Because of the background of the founders of Warm Hut, most people accessing its services were originally from French-speaking African countries. However, a number of Portuguese-speaking people are now also using the charity. A conscious decision was taken by Warm Hut to not ask parents of children attending the homework club about their resident status. However, there are known to be UK citizens, refugees and asylum seekers also accessing the service.

VfM summary – Warm Hut

Net costs = £6,885

Total value added* = £728,294

Effective value generated = £721,409

*Economy and Effectiveness indicators

¹⁷ Powdthavee, N. (2008) Putting a price tag on friends, relatives, and neighbours: Using surveys of life satisfaction to value social relationships. *The Journal of Socio-economics* 37(4), 1459-1480

4.11 Overarching summary

4.11.1 Costs and values of 10 case study organisations

The 10 case studies provide a wealth of information about the value of VCSE organisations in Salford with a focus on Children and Young People. The data that helped us to determine the value added by the organisations (the net costs; the total value added (economy and effectiveness metrics); and the effective value generated) is listed in table 11 below.

Table 11: Overarching costs and values

	Net Costs	Total value added	Effective value generated
53rd BB&GA	£6,558	£95,600	£89,042
Barton Athletic Club	£11,946	£79,220	£67,274
BINOH & Compass	£80,000	£247,600	£167,600
CSIN	£5,320	£261,954	£256,634
Manchester Giants Netball	£8,220	£40,118	£31,898
Mums' and Dads' Club	£583	£6,100	£5,517
Positive Moves	£48,200	£52,936	£4,736
Salford Musical Youth	£3,328	£2,988	£0
Salford Wheels for All	£24,624	£209,692	£185,068
Warm Hut	£6,885	£728,294	£721,409
Totals	£195,664	£1,724,502	£1,529,178

We can use the findings from the ten case study organisations to derive an overarching estimation of the value of VCSE organisations focused on children and young people when compared to their costs. This is done by dividing the total value added (£1,724,502) by the net costs (£195,664). **We therefore estimate that for every £1 spent by the ten organisations creates £8.81 of value.**

4.11.2 Increased confidence as a universal outcome

For each case study, we carefully selected the most appropriate metrics to evidence the value for money for the assessed outcomes. However, it could be argued that improved confidence is an outcome experienced by most if not all children and young people engaged with these organisations. We have therefore calculated an estimation of the value generated by improving confidence alone across the 10 organisations. There are 1,193 children and young people engaged with these groups, the cost of a young person's self-confidence and assertiveness training course is £1,195 per person. Assuming 50% attribution to allow for external influences in the beneficiary's lives, the value associated with increased confidence is estimated to be £712,818.

5 OTHER ORGANISATIONS

Visit from the Stork

Visit from the Stork began in July 2013 working across Salford and Sale (and through a new online community) to provide information, advice, training, and skills to young parents chiefly around pregnancy and breastfeeding. In conjunction with this the group runs journalism classes, creative workshops and helps young parents with their CV's and broader life skills with a view to honing their skill set and boosting their confidence.

The group is addressing mental health issues related to loneliness and boosting the personal resilience of those that attend by providing an environment where skills are naturally passed between young parents at the sessions.

Visit from the Stork is mostly funded by grants with top ups to their funds made through some of the groups activities. One such example is the production and sale of a calendar promoting a positive image and experience of breastfeeding in Salford.

VFM assessment (estimated):

Total costs = £17,000

Unique attendees = 53

Annual attendance = Unknown

Cost p/a per unique attendee = £320.75

Cost p/a per attendance = Unknown

Rainbow Haven

Rainbow Haven provides a community drop-in that offers support and activities for refugees, asylum seekers and vulnerable migrants. Rainbow Haven is a safe haven for people who are displaced and unsure of their future. They provide information, advice, and advocacy to support people with accessing services and understanding UK systems and policies. A weekly drop in session (on a Wednesday) helps individuals and families with children to navigate the benefits system. They promote access to activities that provide educational and social opportunities and support community integration, addressing barriers that affect their ability to settle into life in the UK. They provide ESOL classes, along with a programme of parenting and wellbeing sessions to help parents understand the school system and parenting in the UK.

The outcomes of the groups work are focused around emotionally strengthening individuals and families so that they are able to contribute to society. The support helps them to broaden their social networks and avoid social isolation. Many go on to volunteer at Rainbow Haven to help signpost and refer other people to the right services.

VFM assessment (estimated):

Total costs = £186,000

Unique attendees = Unknown

Annual attendance = 4,800

Cost p/a per unique attendee = Unknown

Cost p/a per attendance = £38.75

Club Tikva

Club Tikva started 6 years ago in Hershel Weiss Sure Start Children's Centre as a small pilot project to help children aged 5-13 with behavioural and communication difficulties and to support parents by equipping them with coping strategies. The demand for the group through word of mouth and referrals was so strong they've had to move across to a bigger venue - The Interlink Foundation in Higher Broughton.

This group aims to help children deal with their emotions, learn how to be calm and how to behave appropriately by providing them with alternative ways to deal with things in a safe, calm and structured environment. Club Tikva runs sessions on most nights of the week including; Arts and crafts, baking, Lego therapy and board games. Each session also includes a formal half hour social skills element.

VFM assessment (estimated):

Total costs = £40,000

Unique attendees = 40

Annual attendance = 1,920

Cost p/a per unique attendee = £1,000

Cost p/a per attendance = £20.83

42nd Street – Q42 Project

42nd Street supports young people aged 11-25 years with their emotional wellbeing and mental health, promoting choice and creativity. The organisation aims to champion young people through the delivery of a holistic programme of mental health support, designed to reduce stigma and to ensure that people get the right support at the right time.

Recently, 42nd Street have started the Q42 project funded by Children in Need. Q42 uses creative social media to engage Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and/or Trans young people and those questioning their gender identity or sexuality (LGBTQ) across Greater Manchester. The project aims to create accessible online pathways to face to face community based support services designed to develop their skills, enable friendships and improve mental wellbeing. This project aims to challenge loneliness and isolation amongst LGBTQ young people and reach them early on when they first seek help or support online.

The project involves weekly group work sessions, and extended project work during school holidays, based at 42nd Street's Manchester base 'The Space' on Great Ancoats Street, as well as with LGBTQ groups across the region. This project will create a safe online space where young LGBTQ people can share their experiences, gain peer support and use creative methods to explore their identity. 42nd Street is working collaboratively with young people in a creative way using social media, new digital tools and a new web platform that will connect them, as well as support them.

VFM assessment (estimated):

Total costs = £34,843 (for one year of a three year project)

Unique attendees = 41

Annual attendance = 1,296

Cost p/a per unique attendee = £849.83

Cost p/a per attendance = £26.89

Lower Kersal Young People's Group

Lower Kersal Young People's Group (LKYPG) started 12 years ago. The organisation initially worked with young people only. Now, although young people still make up a significant portion of those that use LKYPG, it now provides support for a wide range of people that live in the local community.

LKYPG put on a wide range of activities suitable for young people including a youth club, film-making and a pool table. There are around 20 active volunteers that help LKYPG to support young people to achieve a range of outcomes including improved social skills, reduced social isolation, and improved confidence.

VFM assessment (estimated):

Total costs = £26,000

Unique attendees = 100

Annual attendance = 2500

Cost p/a per unique attendee = £260

Cost p/a per attendance = £10.40

The Lifecentre

The Lifecentre provides a wealth of groups and sessions designed to empower and support people in communities to be the best version of themselves. They develop role models in the community by training volunteers, addressing food poverty, building social capital for children, improving emotional literacy and reducing crime & anti-social behaviour.

Their activities include (but are not limited to) making lunch in the school holidays, providing a nurture breakfast group for those with emotional needs, a mobile bus youth session, free legal advice for families, weekly counselling, food parcels and support for refugees.

Their work with children is shaped through a focussed outreach programme to help them engage with the poorest children in deprived areas particularly those in care or on the 'at risk' register. Delay in speech, language and communication skills in Salford is common, engagement at The Lifecentre is helping children to develop these skills at a faster rate, strengthen their own voice and build positive and affirming relationships.

VFM assessment (estimated):

Total costs = £40,000

Unique attendees = 105 (estimated)

Annual attendance = 5705

Cost p/a per unique attendee = £380.95

Cost p/a per attendance = £7.01

EUROPIA

EUROPIA is a community development organisation focusing on the development and integration of Eastern and Central European Migrants (Polish, Czech, Slovak, Hungary, Lithuania, Latvia, Estonia, Romania, Bulgaria & Slovenia). The group works across Greater Manchester to deliver a wide range of projects from sports clubs for young people to ESOL classes, advice and guidance, women's drop-in, Mum and Children sessions, and training for the Eastern European community including help with employability alongside popular family and community events.

Through EUROPIA's creative work and projects, they aim to act as a bridge between local organisations and statutory bodies, helping to enable residents to feel a sense of belonging through their journey towards settling within British society. Europia has also developed relationships with strategic organisations and partners such as Salford Police, Salford CCG (Salford Health matters), Salford University, Manchester Metropolitan University, and the University of Manchester.

VFM assessment (estimated):

Total costs = £26,000

Unique attendees = 1560

Annual attendance = 1560

Cost p/a per unique attendee = £16.66

Cost p/a per attendance = £16.66

6 CONTEXTUALISING THE FINDINGS

This section of the report puts the research and findings into the context of the contemporary policy environment around children and young people at national, regional and the local Salford level. It also offers recommendations flowing from the VfM analysis which will feed into the overarching findings of the 0-25 research and development project.

6.1 Contextualisation

The findings of the VfM study and the wider 0-25 research and development project have to be read in light of prevailing policy contexts and challenges. The work has found that Salford is home to a broad range of VCSE organisations providing activities and services for 0-25 year olds. On the whole these organisations are delivering significant outcomes for not only their beneficiaries, but also the local economy and the state. They are delivering these outcomes in a difficult funding environment, which does not necessarily reward them for their efforts. The majority of the groups rely on the energy of their volunteers to sustain their work.

The organisations often provide an alternative to a lack of state provision of such activities. It has been argued that the VCSE sector should not be seen as an alternative to the state but a core component of the provision of services to children and young people. The challenge in Salford, like many other places in the UK, is that one of the core casualties of austerity has been children and young people's services. So instead of working in partnership and in coordination with the state, the VCSE sector are often left 'picking up the pieces' as provision reduces and children and young people need to look elsewhere.

But in Salford, there is at least a strategic commitment to collaboration across the public and social sectors around children and young people through the 0-25 transformation plan and through associated groups such as VOCAL. Here, Salford City Council, NHS Salford CCG and Salford CVS are working together to address the health and well-being and educational challenges being faced by children and young people.

The local level, is therefore one sphere of influence which this work and the wider 0-25 research and development work links to. However, it should be at the forefront of much wider policy considerations and frameworks. There should be intrinsic links to embedding the role of the VCSE sector thematically in debates around worklessness, educational attainment, ill-health, and social care; and geographically in the process of devolution at Greater Manchester level. The VCSE sector and particularly those organisations with a focus on children and young people should be at the forefront of place based policy making; not bystanders only welcomed in for delivering services.

6.2 Recommendations

Salford needs to continue to further collaborate and cooperate around policy and activities for children and young people. As detailed in previous sections, the VCSE sector provides significant outcomes and VfM and as such should be at the continued heart of such activities. As such, the groups themselves, Salford CVS, NHS Salford CCG and Salford City Council all have a role to play in this and are responsible for taking the findings from this work forwards.

6.2.1 Recommendations for NHS Salford CCG and Salford City Council

Recommendation 1 – NHS Salford CCG and Salford City Council to utilise the findings of this research to recognise and promote the value of the voluntary, community and social enterprise sector in providing activities for children and young people (aged 0-25): the work has identified that VCSE organisations provide a diversity of activities, contribute towards a range of outcomes, and bring savings for the state and impacts for the local economy and Salford residents. This value to be promoted and recognised when investing in future services.

Recommendation 2 – NHS Salford CCG and Salford City Council to support the development of VCSE provision for 0-25 year olds through the 0-25 transformation and to involve the VCSE in ongoing co-design of pathways and services.

6.2.2 Recommendations for Salford CVS

Recommendation 3 – Salford CVS to continue signposting children and young people focused VCSE organisations to a full range of funding opportunities, particularly those with activities around health and well-being. The conversations undertaken as part of the VfM work suggested that many organisations were struggling to access appropriate funding and some appeared unaware of opportunities for grant funding at the local level. Salford CVS as managing agents for the Salford Third Sector Fund Grants Programme, which has annual funds available of £1million should continue to signpost this available funding and develop the awareness and skills in the sector.

Recommendation 4 – Related to recommendation 3, Salford CVS to continue providing capacity building support to children and young people focused voluntary, community and social enterprise organisations to support them to be grant and tender ready (where appropriate) and able to take up other relevant funding opportunities (e.g. community fundraising, sponsorship, subscriptions, social investment, corporate social responsibility funds etc.). By this we mean VCSEs have the capabilities to understand and capacity to complete documentation and other processes (e.g. marketing) to an adequate level and in a way that enables them to secure that funding.

Recommendation 5 – Salford CVS to continue providing specific support to organisations to enable them to demonstrate their impact and value for money. This should not be burdensome but should be relevant to the operating context and proportionate to the size and nature of the group. For example, a small number of outcomes and indicators which groups can relate to and tools which they can utilise to collect data and subsequently demonstrate the value of their activities.

6.2.3 Recommendations for groups

Recommendation 6 – Each of the organisations engaged with as part of this work should know that their work is valued by partners, families and communities and should look to continue the provision of activities for their beneficiaries aged between 0 and 25. In addition they should be encouraged and supported to access development opportunities offered through the 0-25 transformation Programme including: training opportunities in emotional health and well-being, disability including autistic spectrum & speech language and communication awareness.

Recommendation 7 – Act on the recommendations provided by CLES to Salford CVS for each of the 10 case study organisations. These recommendations detail our thoughts on what each organisation could use some help with moving forward to boost the amount of value they are adding through their groups, we have also noted something each of them are already doing brilliantly. These recommendations are based on conversations with those running the groups, our experience in gathering the required information and our observations at our visits.

APPENDIX 1

Consultees

CONSULTEES

Table 12: Consultees

Organisation	Light touch case study	Deep dive analysis
42nd Street	✓	
53rd BB&GA	✓	✓
Barton Athletic Club	✓	✓
BINOH	✓	✓
Club tikva	✓	
CSIN	✓	✓
EUROPIA	✓	
Lower Kersal Young Peoples group	✓	
Manchester Giants	✓	✓
Mums' and Dads' Club	✓	✓
Positive Moves	✓	✓
Rainbow Haven	✓	
Salford Musical Youth	✓	✓
Salford Wheels for all	✓	✓
The Life centre	✓	
Visit from the Stork	✓	
Warm Hut	✓	✓

APPENDIX 2
Guide for VfM framework

GUIDE FOR VFM FRAMEWORK



Salford 0-25 VCSE Research and Development Project - Value for Money Interview Proforma

Notes for interviewers:

- ❑ Before the interview, you need to review existing information on the organisation that has been recorded by Salford CVS. Use this information to begin to fill out the proforma, and then seek to fill the gaps during the interview. This will ensure a more efficient process and minimise duplication.
 - ❑ You need to sufficiently cover *all* questions in this proforma, as they are all directly relevant to the completion of the value for money framework. Please do not leave any gaps.
 - ❑ Ask if there is any additional documentation that you could access to help you further in this work – link to a website, additional materials on activities, costs, outcomes for example, that could be emailed across to you.
 - ❑ At the end of the interview, ask the respondent whether they would consider being involved in a more in-depth case study over December/January. This would involve:
 - Consulting with some of the beneficiaries directly, for example through focus groups – this would be primarily to understand in more depth the outcomes that people feel that they are achieving;
 - Speaking with other staff/partners/stakeholders about the organisation’s impact, and its connections within the locality and broader networks;
 - Explain that we would ensure that it would not take up much of their time – for instance, we would seek to conduct beneficiary consultation when they are delivering their activities, and would provide high street vouchers for young people who get involved. We will also provide another £50-£100 for agreeing to this further engagement.
 - It is also important to state that the case study could also be used as a promotional tool by themselves, illustrating the work they do and difference they make to children and young people. Following the completion of the work, we and a representative from Salford CVS, would also be happy to visit them and provide some support in demonstrating how the information from the value for money assessment could be utilised by them, and ways in which they can measure this in future.
- 1)** Name of the organisation (chosen following agreement between Lucy Sutcliffe and CLEES)
 - 2)** Key aims and objectives and/or priorities for the organisation (information should already be available through previous engagement by Lucy)
 - 3)** What are the main sources of income for your organisation?
 - 4)** If a significant amount of your income is through funding, are there any specific targets that you need to aim towards to meet funders’ criteria? (e.g. number of sessions, number of children engaged, number of children and young people engaged across a geographical area, or in a particular activity)

- 5) Who are the specific target groups for the work that they do? (information should already be available through previous engagement by Lucy)
- 6) Do you know much it costs to run your organisation/project/programme? (data may already be available through Lucy – if not, it depends on what they know off-hand but if we can get an annual cost that would be very useful) Note to interviewer - see if they can provide a copy of their annual accounts if possible to provide specific costs.
- 7) What activities are undertaken by your organisation? (information should already be available through previous engagement by Lucy)
- 8) How long have you been undertaking these activities with children and young people? (information may already be available through previous engagement by Lucy)
- 9) What outputs are measured? (information should already be available through previous engagement – it is important that we get data on outputs – if available, outputs for over the year)
- 10) How do you record your outputs? Do you have any difficulties in recording these? (maybe through registration forms, information of session delivered – need to know whether it is hard copy system of recording outputs or whether they are captured electronically)
- 11) What types of outcomes are you looking to achieve with children and young people – these are things that you intend to change or benefits that you hope to bring about (some of this will be available through previous engagement, but there may be a need to go into further detail here – examples may include, depending on the activities: improved self-esteem and confidence; improved mental health; improved physical health; better family relationships; increased volunteering; improved employability skills, and so on)
- 12) How are the outcomes recorded? Can they be recorded? (may not be possible to record outcomes properly if they are softer – e.g. improved self-esteem and confidence, better levels of physical fitness, improved mental health, or better social networks – this is where we will need to value them with financial proxies)
- 13) Are there other things in children’s and young people’s lives that you think might also be contributing to their outcomes? (e.g. family, friends, any other services they, children and young people have engaged with)
- 14) If your organisation did not exist, to what extent do you think the outcomes for young people and children could be achieved? (note that this is a question that they may answer with a heavy bias, but we would anticipate asking the same question to a stakeholder and, in the case studies, the beneficiaries too)
- 15) How would you personally define success in terms of what you do with children and young people? (an open question giving them the opportunity to put forward their perceptions of success)
- 16) Do you have any issues in engaging with certain groups that you want to target? Why is this? (could be based upon age, gender, protected characteristics, ethnicity etc – who is particularly hard to reach)

APPENDIX 3

Guide for case study consultation

GUIDE FOR CASE STUDY CONSULTATION

What we're aiming to do

Following the research and engagement exercise, CLES will analyse the information for each organisation to come to a judgement on value for money. This will seek to determine four things:

Economy: evidencing that the activities of the organisations have minimised public sector costs and were economical;

Efficiency: evidencing that the services provided to achieve the outcomes were at a reasonable cost;

Effectiveness: evidencing the extent the services have the desired impact in terms of outcomes.

Equity: the extent to which services are available to and reach all people that they are intended to (e.g. all those with protected characteristics, disabled, BME groups, for example).

The evidence for the value for the money assessment will be based on two components:

Qualitative input: this will consider all of the qualitative information, from partners, stakeholders to beneficiaries, to determine perceptions of the effectiveness and efficiency of the activities of each group. This is important in forming the narrative around the quantitative evidence and illustrating the level of social value that is developed across the organisations.

Quantitative input: this will include costs, outputs and outcomes achieved, and data collected through surveys (e.g. where relevant ranking children and young people's reflections on the impact on their personal outcomes).

The requirements and questions

Organisers – Economy, Efficiency and Equity

To run the numbers side of this assessment we need the following as a bare minimum*;

- Number of 0-25 attendees per session
- Total number of 0-25's engaged (per year)
- Number of sessions for 0-25's (per year)
- Cost to run each session for 0-25's
- Any charges to 0-25 attendees per session

*** If you are unable to get figures for age 0-25's only please get what data they have available for all ages and ask them to estimate the % of 0-25's in attendance.**

Beneficiaries – Effectiveness

These questions are generic – they will need to be tailored to make sure they are relevant to the outcomes of each organisation.

- How long have you been attending these sessions?
- How did you hear about these sessions?
- Why do you come to these sessions?
- The people that run the session told us that ____, ____ and ____ are the most common outcomes for people attending these sessions – would you agree?
- What do you get from these sessions?
- Have you noticed any positive changes in yourself since starting these sessions?
- Are those positive changes all due to this session or are there other factors involved?
- Where would you be right now if this session wasn't available?
- Are there any other similar sessions locally that you could attend?
- If you had 3 words to sum up your experience here what would they be?